



AN ANALYSIS OF DEMOGRAPHICAL DIMENSIONS WITH SUGGESTED REFORMS IN PRIVATE SECURITY SECTOR OF PAKISTAN

SUNDUS RAUF,¹ ASAD ZAMAN KAYANI,² AND AMNA ZAHID³

Abstract

This paper has been extracted from the thesis conducted by the researchers during their Masters in Criminology and Security Studies degree with the title “Major impediments in the growth of private Security Sector: A leading future industry of Pakistan”. The research focused on the emergence of private security industry in Pakistan with its historical evolution, present day challenges and the problems which the private security guards are facing with the conclusion recommending certain reforms to improve this vital sector of the country. The research, as a whole, was mixed method research in which the review of previous literature was conducted through qualitative approach and the data from private security guards was collected by survey which was then quantified for analysis. The outcomes and the results of the survey were discussed through descriptive method. The findings of the research provided sufficient material to establish that the private security sector is a rapidly growing industry not only in Pakistan but at the global level the importance of which cannot be denied. However, it needs to be focused upon on serious basis as the security measures and its demand required by the individuals and the organizations are not now limited only to their person and property but also to their intellectual property and cyberspace information for which revolutionary transition is inevitable to meet the required needs of the time.

This research paper is consisting of only that part of the thesis which is relating to the collection, analysis, findings and discussion about the basic information of this actual thesis work i.e. relating to age, gender, relevant job experience, qualification duty hours, and salary to collect the general information about the security guards. Rest of the information will be discussed in the next paper.

Key Words: Private Security, Security Guards, Problems,

1. INTRODUCTION

The word security means “*the state of being free from danger or threat*”. After the incident of 9/11, security situation throughout the world drastically changed.⁴ Pakistan also had to face the post 9/11 effects which put Pakistan in a state of war against terrorism for decades. It created the situation of uncertainty, fear and full time security threats in the country.⁵ Other security threats include ethnicity, sectarianism, religious extremism and economic instability which can be observed as internal security variables.⁶

People want to live a fear-free life while living in their homeland. Protection and security is the fundamental right of every citizen. During the past few years, the private security industry has noticeably become more specialized, trained, reactive and integrated. It is being observed that the

¹ Assistant Professor, College of Law, The University of Lahore (sundas.rauf@law.uol.edu.pk)

² M.Sc. Criminology & Security Studies, Institute of Social & Cultural Studies, University of the Punjab, Lahore

³ M.Sc. Criminology & Security Studies, Institute of Social & Cultural Studies, University of the Punjab, Lahore

⁴ Anna Visvizi, Safety, Risk, Governance and the Eurozone Crisis: Rethinking the Conceptual Merits of ‘Global Safety Governance’ [ResearchGate 2015] <
https://www.researchgate.net/publication/288786883_Safety_risk_governance_and_the_Eurozone_crisis_rethinking_the_conceptual_merits_of_'global_safety_governance'> Accessed 12 July 2020

⁵ Shireen M Mazari, Pakistan in the Post-9/11 Milieu [22(3) JSTORE: Strategic Studies 2002] 1-17

⁶ Naveed Safdar, Internal Security Threats to Pakistan [ResearchGate 2004]<
https://www.researchgate.net/publication/235137940_Internal_Security_Threats_to_Pakistan> Accessed 12 July 2020



criminals and security threats are tremendously increasing day by day while resources of traditional law enforcement and police services are highly insufficient to handle this situation.⁷ Therefore, the security industry has had to quickly position itself as a highly effectual and alert alternative.

Private security industry is an essential element of security and safety in every state of the world. In the present time, private security sector is responsible to protect many of the national institutions and critical infrastructures. It is also protecting intellectual property and sensitive corporate information. In Pakistan, companies also rely heavily on private security for a wide range of functions that include protecting employees and property, conducting investigations, performing pre-employment screening, providing information technology security, and many other functions of the same nature.⁸

“Private security” is the security offered by the persons hired by the private security companies. This is the alternate arrangement in the individual capacity by the people who deem themselves to be at risk. This service is a paid service.⁹ A **“Security Guard”** can be defined as *“a person employed to protect buildings, people etc. and to collect and deliver a large sum of money”*.¹⁰

2. PROBLEM STATEMENT

This paper has been extracted from the research which was intended to identify major factors which are proving to be the impediments and hurdles in the growth of private security sector of Pakistan which is going to be the leading future industry of Pakistan particularly focusing on the capacity of the private security guards in terms of various variables necessary for handling this sensitive nature of responsibility and to suggest valuable recommendations for its proper regulation and reformation on the basis of the findings of the research.

3. OBJECTIVES OF RESEARCH

The primary objective of this research is to analyze the capabilities of private security guards to observe their competencies and to assess them according to the needs of this security sector. The aim of this research is particularly to identify the gaps in terms of evaluation of the private security guards, by highlighting the facts as to whether they are fully equipped and trained for this job and are satisfied and if not, then what are the reasons behind that and how these areas can be improved to make this industry most beneficial and strong.

4. RESEARCH QUESTION

This paper involves that part of research project which is addressing the questions relating to the age, gender, previous relevant experience, qualification, duty hours, and salary of the participants.

5. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This study has been conducted using qualitative and non-empirical research approach through cross-sectional study with descriptive research design. Cross-sectional study has been used because it relates to the types of observational research involving analysis of data of variables collected at one point of time across a sample population or a pre-defined subset, which is also known as cross-sectional analysis, transverse study or prevalence study. The purpose using this methodology was that it is relatively quick as all the variables can be collected at one time. Moreover, the data

⁷ Hassan Abbas, Police & Law Enforcement Reforms in Pakistan: Crucial for Counterinsurgency and Counterterrorism Success [2009] < <https://www.ispu.org/police-law-enforcement-reform-in-pakistan-crucial-for-counterinsurgency-and-counterterrorism-success/> > Accessed 10 July 2020

⁸ Mohammad Ali Babakhel, The Growing Demand for Private Security [Tribune 2016] < <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1031851/the-growing-demand-for-private-security> > Accessed 10 July 2020

⁹ SMARTSecurityPros, Private & Public Security: Do You Know the Difference? [2019] < <https://smartsecuritypros.com/private-vs-public-security-guards/> > Accessed 10 July 2020

¹⁰ Charles P Nemeth, Private Security Personnel [4th edn Private Security and the Law 2012] ScienceDirect 69-115



collected during this study is suitable for descriptive study and can also be used for further research.

Descriptive research approach has been used to identify how frequently, widely, or severely the variables of interest occur because it can better describe a population, situation or phenomenon under study. It has a qualitative approach but includes quantifiable data as well. The purpose of this mixed method research is to describe, explain or validate some sort of hypothesis or objective relating to a specific group of people. It has been conducted through observations, case studies and surveys as research tools.

6. DATA COLLECTION, ANALYSIS, RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

6.1 Data Collection and Research Tool

Data was collected from primary and secondary sources by applying various research techniques and using different instruments or tools. Information for literature review was collected from books, articles, newspapers, and digital sources etc. where the direct information from the private security guards was collected through structured questionnaire and interviews.

Close-ended questionnaire with binary answers in **yes/no** was used which was designed with 35 simple but easy to comprehend questions under six main headings relating to their training and skills, hiring criteria, job satisfaction, scope and growth of this profession and to seek their suggestions for its improvement .

After preparation of questionnaire and before starting the survey, **Pilot Testing** was conducted to check the validity of the questionnaire. Eight questionnaires were got filled during pilot testing and then this questionnaire was used for survey to collect the data.

During this survey all the data was collected in person by gaining the access to the sample. Security guards of few hospitals, bakeries, girls' hostels, petrol pumps, restaurants and residential societies were personally approached to fill out the questionnaire. Effort was made to get exact information from those who were not literate enough to read out and fill out the form on their own. They were helped to get understanding by explaining questions in their own language and then to get answer. Difficulty was also faced during this process while trying to approach security guards of well-known malls and plazas for data collection as they refused to share any kind of information according to their job policy.

6.1.1 Population and Sampling

Population of this study comprises of the public, private security companies and private security guards of Lahore, Pakistan. The study was limited to this single city due to the then prevailing COVID-19 pandemic situation.

6.1.2 Sampling Techniques

In the instant research work non-probability purposive sampling technique has been used for collection of data.

6.1.3 Sample Size

The sample size taken during this research work was 211 which consisted of private security guards employed in various organizations, hospitals, shops, restaurants, banks and residential societies in Lahore city to perform the duties of providing security.

6.2 Data Analysis

The collected data was analyzed through descriptive analysis and by using various techniques after processing it through SPSS version 21, in order to find results and to draw inference, whether to accept or reject the hypothesis. Before analysis, the data was carefully collected, arranged and manipulated for identification and removal of any error, omission, mistake, missing or wrong entry. It was then classified by assigning codes after which it was analyzed through using descriptive analysis to find results and to propose recommendations.

Descriptive Statistics (Age, Experience, Qualification, Duty Hours, Salary)

Information from 211 participants was obtained regarding their age, experience, education, duty hours and salary. 183 of the participants were males and 28 were females. The information was



collected through questionnaires concealing their identity as per research ethics guidelines. The results obtained through descriptive analysis of data are as following:

Table 1

	N	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	Std. Deviation
Age	211	23.00	69.00	50.55	10.56
Experience	211	1.00	33.00	13.71	8.49
Qualification	211	8.00	16.00	11.03	2.00
Duty Hours	211	8.00	12.00	10.86	1.81
Salary	211	12.00	22.00	16.00	1.81

It was found that the mean age of the participants was 50.55 ± 10.56 years, mean experience was found to be of 13.71 ± 8.49 years, mean qualification was found to be of 11.03 ± 2.00 years, means duty hours were found to be 10.86 ± 1.81 hours while mean salary was found to be 16 ± 1.81 thousands.

The results show that most of the security guards are middle aged or above, with unsatisfactory relevant experience, mostly with average or medium level of qualification but a few with higher level of education who are forced to do this job due to certain socio-economic factors. The salary which the security guards are drawing is not sufficient enough as compared to their needs, nature of responsibility and duty hours. The participants are also not found sufficiently qualified.

Association of Age, Experience and Salary with "Gender"

Table 2

	Gender	N	Mean	Std. Deviation	t- Test value
Age	Male	183	51.3224	10.59027	3.11/0.003
	Female	28	45.5000	9.00411	
Experience	Male	183	14.1148	8.76826	2.40/0.02
	Female	28	11.0714	5.79226	
Salary	Male	183	16.0000	1.52992	-0.06/0.95
	Female	28	16.0357	3.12080	

Results: The mean age of male respondents who participated in the survey was 51.3224 ± 10.59027 years whereas mean age of female respondents was 45.500 ± 9.00411 years. This difference was statistically significant (0.003).

The mean experience of male respondents who participated in the survey was 14.1148 ± 8.76826 years whereas mean experience of female respondents was 11.0714 ± 5.79226 years. This difference was statistically significant (0.02).

The mean salary of male respondents who participated in the survey was 16.0000 \pm 1.52992 thousands whereas mean salary of female respondents was 16.0357 \pm 3.12080 thousands. This difference was statistically insignificant (0.95).

Discussion: When the variables of age, experience and salary were analyzed in terms of gender it was found that age of most of the males was ranging between 40 to 60 years with the exception of a few whereas the female participants were mostly between the age group of 36 to 54 years. Although experience of male participants was comparatively more than that of female participants but that was not up to the mark as the security guards were mostly lacking proper training and skills which will be discussed in the next research paper. The most astonishing fact of the research results was the salary of the participants which was unbelievably meager ranging from 16000 rupees to 20000 rupees with the exception of a few who reported that they are getting up to 25000 rupees. Overall, male members were found greater in number in age, experience, and salary who are serving this profession as compared to the females who are rather younger, less experienced and drawing a little less salary than male security guards.

Association of Age and Salary with “Job Experience”

Table 3

	Exp_Years	N	Mean	Std. Deviation	t- Test value
Age	<15	137	46.32	9.72	10.36/ <0.001
	>15	74	58.38	7.01	
Salary	<15	137	16.02	1.93	0.19/0.85
	>15	74	15.97	1.58	

Results: The mean age of participants with job experience less than 15 years was 46.32 \pm 9.72 years whereas mean age of participants with job experience more than 15 years was 58.38 \pm 7.01 years. This difference was statistically significant (<0.001).

The mean salary of participants with job experience less than 15 years was 16.02 \pm 1.93 thousands whereas mean salary of participants with job experience more than 15 years was 15.97 \pm 1.58 thousands. This difference was statistically insignificant (0.85).

Discussion: Association of age and salary was also analyzed with job experience to observe whether they had any impactful dependence on one another. It was identified through the obtained results that 137 of the participants had less than 15 years of experience in the relevant field and they were also mostly not associated with any law enforcement agencies. On the other hand, 74 participants were reported as having more than 15 years of experience because many of them had been part of law enforcement in any capacity. A strange variation was also observed in salary range of the participants that the people who were comparatively young with lesser experience were drawing more salary than those who were older but with greater experience. Inverse relation of age and experience was found with the salary.

Association of Age and Salary with “Education”

Table 4

	Education	N	Mean	Std. Deviation	t- Test value
Age	Up to Matric	148	51.16	9.68	1.16/0.25



	Above Matric	63	49.13	12.36	
Salary	Up to Matric	148	14.98	0.82	-23.00/<0.001
	Above Matric	63	18.41	1.06	

Results: The mean age of participants with education up to Matric was 51.16 ± 9.68 years whereas mean age of participants with education above Matric was 49.13 ± 12.36 years. This difference was statistically insignificant (0.25).

The mean salary of participants with education up to Matric was 14.98 ± 0.82 thousands whereas mean salary of participants with education above Matric was 18.41 ± 1.06 . This difference was statistically significant (<0.001).

Discussion: This study also focused on association of education with age and salary of the participants and found that 148 of them were having education below matriculation and were relating to the senior age group whereas 63 were qualified above matriculation and were comparatively younger. The salary of security guards was also found higher than those with less qualification. Here again the older security guards with less qualification were identified to be with less salary.

7. FINDINGS OF RESEARCH WITH INTERPRETATION

The results obtained on the basis of information, which was directly collected from the participants who were the employed and on service security guards at different places, buildings and areas of Lahore, revealed that this sector is highly neglected in several aspects. The city selected for this research is one of the largest cities of Pakistan and is considered to be the hub for educational, commercial and other activities where people from all around the country come for education, business, health facilities and jobs etc. The residents particularly those who are owning their properties or business, may develop rivalries, and may also develop fear for criminal activities hence they may need proper security arrangements for which they employ security guards. For these reasons the prevalence and importance of private security sector can neither be denied in this busiest city nor can the results of this study be doubted therefore the same can be generalized for the country as a whole.

The results of the research identified that most of the security guards are around fifty years of age and are not physically fit to shoulder this responsibility. Even several of them have no proper training and skills to operate advanced weapons and to take prompt action in case of any mishap. They are also not provided any medical facility or allowance. Majority of the security guards are males as females rarely adopt this profession. The number of females found for this study was mostly employed at malls and educational institutions where they comparatively feel secured. Important aspect of qualification is also found missing among security guards. During survey, it was realized that most of them were even not able to read the questionnaire in English and to understand that to give answer. Most astonishingly, many of them were not even conversant for communicating in Urdu. Researchers had to clarify the questions in Punjabi to get their answers and to collect information.

The security guards are highly exploited in terms of their salaries as they are highly underpaid drawing a meager salary ranging from 16000 to 25000 rupees only. Age, experience and educations have an impact on salary. The older employees are being paid less as compared to the younger ones even though the senior staff claimed to be needy to support their families with several members. They are being exploited due to their old and retired status. This is also a bitter reality that the



others who are drawing comparatively better salary are also not able enough to meet their financial needs just basing only on this job.

This fact raises another concern as to shifts and duty hours of security guards. Their shift may vary from eight hours to twelve hours shift without any break or rest. This is not humanly possible for an individual to perform duty as a security guard, which requires extreme vigilance, along with some other work to earn their livelihood because with this job only, no one can feed their family in this time of high inflation. It may divert them to earn from illegal means which may adversely impact the purpose and definition of their job and its description.

8. CONCLUSION WITH RECOMMENDATIONS

The security guards hold very important position in society as they perform duties of protecting persons and their properties. Their age, qualification, experience, training and duty hours must be under special consideration. Above all, they should be paid reasonably as they are supposed to put their lives in danger for protecting the millions worth properties of others.

Statistics with the wages for security in the U.S. 2019 as mentioned in (Mazareanu E. , States with the highest wages for security guards in the U.S. 2019, 2020) reveal that the security guards are drawing very attractive salaries in U.S. average salary for the year 2019 for a security guard was 44,200 U.S. dollars annually which is very high as compared to that being paid in Pakistan.

It is an important employment sector of the country which has its significance for the reason of providing security services to the citizens, organizations, schools, hospitals, offices etc. In this way it is sharing the burden of law enforcement. Law enforcement agencies of the country are responsible for the enforcement of law of the land and to safe guard the rights of citizens by protecting their person and property. They are empowered to investigate crime whenever happens to any person. State is responsible to provide security to all of the citizens without any discrimination. But unfortunately our state is not able to meet all the needs of security sector due to insufficiency of required number of public security officials.

Public security officials are engaged in various tasks which they are to perform on the instructions and directions of their respective department. They are to perform surveillance duties, guards the border areas, patrol the highways, investigate the crimes etc. They are also dealing with the challenges like insufficient funds, lack of capacity building, low manpower, inadequate weapons and equipment etc.

In these circumstances public security sector is not able to provide security to every citizen of the country. People are to manage private security for themselves to protect their person and property and to prevent the chance of happening of any criminal activity to them. Private security guards are the persons who are to fulfill the security needs of such people who are at some risk either due to their social status, nature of business, ethnic, racial or religious extremism, being a high profile person or for some other connected reason.

Keeping in view all these facts and the results of instant research work, following recommendations are being proffered for the growth and development of this emerging industry in order to make it more efficient and robust economic and employment sector:

i. Security Clearance and Salary

Our Security system is traditionally known as 'Chowkidary System'. The most important part of the policy matter is that in developed countries a security guard needs to get security clearance from the Government authority; like in Abu Dhabi. It is important for the company to get the security clearance of its guards from the Ministry of Interior or Military Headquarter prior to his training.

Moreover, our Security companies are not getting the proper Security clearance of their guards from the relevant authorities like NADRA during their recruiting process. Our industrialists often feel that they should not bear this extra burden since they are paying a huge sum of money in the form of taxes. They keep quiet as the current situation of our country is not stable due to terrorism. Our banking sector is the most affected sector due to robber's attacks as it lost billions of rupees. These aspects need to be re-evaluated and enforced in true letter and spirit keeping in



view the welfare of the security guard as well as the back ground check along with the main data bank collection of all the security guard personnel.

ii. Insurance and Compensation Packages

With bundle of threats pouring in from within and outside country, law and order situation is further deteriorating day by day. The awestruck people facing impending perils of suicide bombing find no way to escape. Consequently, they resort to private security companies run by different people who provide security guards that apparently protect private residences and business places. These young lads are equipped only with a simple gun which in does not suffice in case of any terror attack. Most of them do not have any physical training to combat terror attacks. Obviously, they serve as watch guards and in case of any attack, the poor fellows suffer heavily, even lose their life in a bid to perform their duty. Being paid a meager amount, these guards do not have any insurance cover to safeguard their family after them. The insurance coverage and compensation packages need to be stricter for every personnel employed by the private Security Company.

iii. Improving Job Conditions

Job conditions in private security sector must be improved. There must be standardized job conditions relating to duty hours, salary package, promotion, working environment, provision of weapons etc. It should be understood that security guards are offering their lives to protect others and are working to look after and feed their families. With low salary package and long duty hours they can never be satisfied. If they are not satisfied they would not be able to perform their duties which require due diligence. Therefore, their job conditions must be improved by increasing salary and reducing duty hours in particular.

iv. Proper Chain of Command

There is a need to have an autonomous body with a proper chain of command for proper managing and controlling of the private security sector.

v. Monitoring and Information System

Monitoring and information systems should potentially and actually be improved. All the data of these companies must be digitalized and updated in every aspect.

vi. Checking any Abuse of Power

There is a need to have proper system through government Acts to curtail and define the abuse of power and authority which impacts on society at large by the private security agencies. Dishonesty and poor business practices should be curbed with strict actions against the defaulters through the centralized private security act.

vii. Criminal Actions on Crimes reported by Security Guards

Non-reporting of crimes under the umbrella of private justice systems should be discontinued. Mostly the crime reported by security guards is not taken seriously for criminal action. On spot settlement is mostly preferred in such situations. This practice must be checked and curtailed.

viii. System of Punishment and Rewards

There is a need to provide positive incentive instead of negative sanctions. Rewards and financial benefits should be given to the daring and dedicated security guards so that they could feel encouraged and motivated.

A regulated procedure of punishment should be enhanced in case of defaulters and violators. Security companies which are not registered must be checked and those who are not fulfilling all the required criteria must be banned.

LIMITATIONS OF STUDY

Due to COVID-19 situation it was not possible to conduct a detailed survey. Therefore study area had to be limited to Lahore city only. Sample size was also to be kept smaller due to this reason as the sample was consisting of the people majority of whom were not able to read and write. Therefore, it was necessary to take information by visiting them personally instead of electronic survey.



Another limitation was the lack of education and understanding of the respondents. It was a tedious work to read each and every question to the security guards, to explain it and then to get correct information from them.

Another constraint was the reluctance of security guards to provide proper information due to the observation of their supervisors as they were not allowed to disclose any such information. At several well known places and shopping malls, they refused to cooperate and to fill up the questionnaire.

Another problem faced during this research work was to collect secondary data by visiting libraries as these were closed at that time due to the prevailing COVID-19 situation. Therefore, online sources were used for secondary data collection.

Disclaimer: This research paper has been derived from thesis conducted by the authors along with the other co-authors on the topic titled “*Major impediments in the growth of Private Security Sector: A leading future industry of Pakistan*”. The thesis has not been published anywhere and this is the original and novel work of the authors. The other two authors have no objection in its publication.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- [1] Anna V, Safety, Risk, Governance and the Eurozone Crisis: Rethinking the Conceptual Merits of ‘Global Safety Governance’ [ResearchGate 2015] < https://www.researchgate.net/publication/288786883_Safety_risk_governance_and_the_Euro_zone_crisis_rethinking_the_conceptual_merits_of_global_safety_governance> Accessed 12 July 2020
- [2] Shireen M M, Pakistan in the Post-9/11 Milieu [22(3) JSTORE: Strategic Studies 2002] 1-17
- [3] Naveed S, Internal Security Threats to Pakistan [ResearchGate 2004]< https://www.researchgate.net/publication/235137940_Internal_Security_Threats_to_Pakistan > Accessed 12 July 2020
- [4] Hassan A, Police & Law Enforcement Reforms in Pakistan: Crucial for Counterinsurgency and Counterterrorism Success [2009] < <https://www.ispu.org/police-law-enforcement-reform-in-pakistan-crucial-for-counterinsurgency-and-counterterrorism-success/>> Accessed 10 July 2020
- [5] Mohammad A B, The Growing Demand for Private Security [Tribune 2016] < <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1031851/the-growing-demand-for-private-security>> Accessed 10 July 2020
- [6] SMARTSecurityPros, Private & Public Security: Do You Know the Difference? [2019] < <https://smartsecuritypros.com/private-vs-public-security-guards/>> Accessed 10 July 2020
- [7] Charles P N, Private Security Personnel [4th edn Private Security and the Law 2012] ScienceDirect 69-115