

SUBALTERN PRACTICES IN SINGLE NATIONAL CURRICULUM OF PAKISTAN: A CASE-STUDY OF ENGLISH LANGUAGE TEXTBOOKS

1: UZMA QADIR

M.Phil Scholar Riphah International University, Faisalabad

2: DR. MAIMOONA ABDULAZIZ

Assistant Professor

Head Department of English

National University of Modern Languages

Faisalabad Campus

3: FAREEHA MASTOOR

M.Phil Scholar Riphah International University, Faisalabad

4: MARIA SALAHUDDIN

M.Phil Scholar Riphah International University Faisalabad

Abstract-Single National Curriculum (SNC) is a historical initiative by the government of Pakistan that aims to provide equal opportunities for high-level quality education to all children and to discourage a class-based education system. The present study aims to evaluate the subaltern practices in a Single National Curriculum (SNC) in the English language textbooks (Grades: 1-3) of the Punjab Textbook Board (PTB). This research investigates whether English textbooks are fulfilling the practical needs of learners, offer the appropriate activities, and are contextually relevant by applying the CREDIBLE approach model. A mixed method approach was applied for a broad understanding of the evaluation and suggestions for improvement. The model contains 8 features that were applied to the textbooks to check whether English textbooks meet the standards of the model or not. The outcomes of the study show that the SNC English textbooks (Grades: 1-3) are contextually relevant, but reading and comprehension questions and creative writing sections of activities do not fulfill the needs of the learners. Teachers' opinions about the SNC syllabus in terms of contextual relevance, learner needs, local beliefs, and other aspects of the CREDIBLE model were also collected in the form of questionnaires. The findings showed similarity to the outcomes of the CREDIBLE model application on SNC.

Keywords: CREDIBLE Approach, English Language Textbook, Subaltern Linguistics, Single National Curriculum, SNC

INTRODUCTION

Colonizing powers promote their own policies and practices in countries where they rule and force the communities to give up their own practices and follow their ways to progress. Such implementations lead to the destruction of local ways of doing especially in the education and academic disciplines of indigenous communities. Subaltern Linguistics is a new branch of linguistics introduced by Mahboob (2019) with the purpose to empower such communities to promote their socio-semiotic practices in the language of their choice for their well-being and prosperity.

Another aim to employ subaltern practices is to evaluate the practices, projects, and resources of a community and to observe the association between socio-semiotic and material systems in order to create material for their self-empowerment. The educational system in most parts of South Asia, including Pakistan, focuses on literacy (sight) and oral (sound) ways of teaching ignoring other material senses. As a result, educators are used to depending on these two material senses and focus on things that are far from them instead of paying attention to things that exist in their premises. To be brief, Subaltern Linguistics is a practice to empower communities to create prosperous and harmonized societies away from the influence of colonial power. The person who is involved in subaltern practices and uses the language for community empowerment is called a Subaltern Linguist.



The government of Pakistan implemented Single National Curriculum (SNC) in the education year 2020 as one system of education, a medium of instruction, and a common platform of assessment for all students. It focused on a concept that advocates universal education. One of the most significant benefits of having a unified national curriculum is the promotion of social equality. When it is fully implemented, all children will enjoy an equal and fair chance of receiving quality education. It is critical to examine if present SNC English textbooks are effective and respond to fulfill the needs of English language teachers and pupils. This study addresses issues regarding cultural and local beliefs, social aspects, and the effectiveness of SNC syllabus activities using the CREDIBLE approach. The CREDIBLE approach has not been applied before to check the CREDIBILITY issues in SNC which was the main focus of the current research work.

Problem Statement

There is a need to evaluate the subaltern practices in SNC. Hence, the current research explores SNC in reference to cultural compatibility and variations, benefits to the local communities, practical needs, contextual relevancy, grammatical features, appropriateness of activities, and language issues to recommend positive changes in material development strategies.

Research Objectives

Owing to the purpose of the research the following objectives have been set:

- Identify subalternity used in English language textbooks of SNC from grades 1-3
- Recommend positive changes in English language textbooks of SNC based on these results

Research Questions

In order to achieve the said objectives, the following research questions are set to be answered:

1. How far do the English language textbooks of SNC effective in terms of the CREDIBLE approach?
 - a. To what extent does contextual relevancy exist in SNC English textbooks?
 - b. To what extent do SNC English textbooks respond to the practical needs of learners?
 - c. To what extent does the content compatible or vary culturally or ethically?
 - d. To what extent does SNC comprehensible for learners in terms of local and religious beliefs, social practices, and expressions?
 - e. To what extent does the SNC English textbook provide benefits to local communities?
2. Which subaltern practices are prominent in the SNC English language textbooks (Grades: 1-3)?

Scope and Significance

The present research is about the evaluation of English textbooks in order to check the subaltern practices by applying the CREDIBLE approach model. The results of the given study are significant for the stakeholders and practitioners involved in the field of English language teaching. By highlighting credibility issues, the current research can also be beneficial for syllabus designers, lesson planners, teacher trainers, teachers and examiners, and the whole education system. This research recommends positive changes to the government in order to improve the education standard.

Research Limitation

The focus of the present research is only on SNC (Grades: 1-3) English language textbooks and results may not be applicable to other SNC books written in English. The results may not be generalizable to English textbooks of grades other than grades 1-3. Although the analysis was conducted using the CREDIBLE framework (Mahboob, 2019) which is logically qualitative in nature, the validity of its results has been increased via expert opinion and through a quantitative survey.

Research Delimitation

The research is delimited to English language textbooks of SNC from grades 1-3 only due to time constraints.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Textbooks are the most significant teaching and learning materials among resources. Since the 1960s textbooks have been implemented as a wide range of supplementary materials. Textbooks and particularly authentic material play an important role in foreign language teaching and



learning. In 2013, McDonough, Masuhara, and Shaw defined the process of textbook evaluation that can be done by investigating the content of a textbook in two ways named external and internal evaluation. The internal evaluation focuses on the materials comprising exercises and tasks. External evaluation deals with the physical appearance like the cover, table of content, introduction, and so on. The mixture of internal and external approaches to the evaluation of textbooks is understood as a main thing to be directed as it provides comprehensive information to the teachers about the appropriateness of certain textbooks in terms of physical appearances and contents.

Textbook evaluation is seen as an important thing to be conducted. A study conducted by Waheed et al., (2021) showed local cultural aspects in Pakistani English textbooks at the intermediate level. This study helps find the problematic areas regarding the content of the textbook. The process of evaluating textbooks can be done by examining the content, social and cultural contexts, general appearance and design, objectives, tasks and activities, and usefulness for developing language skills. This study also reviews the literature concerning textbook evaluation, referring to various theoretical and empirical studies that have contributed to the field of educational material evaluation (Alsulami, 2021). Some teachers and authors have the notion that traditional teaching methods cannot properly build up the four elementary skills (listening, reading, writing, and speaking) of the language in SLA (second language acquisition). These teachers and authors believe that traditional methods focus on memorizing, answering and not questioning, checking and not correcting, and individual learning rather than the group (Ali et al., 2021).

In 2014, Mohammadi evaluated the book's general instructional usefulness and fit for students' requirements. Jahan (2020) investigated the assimilation of Pakistani English textbooks with the communicative approach in material design. A checklist was used to evaluate the data, and worksheet items were related to goals, content, supported material, physical attributes, and sequence of listening, speaking, reading, writing, and grammar language skill. Khalili & Jodai (2012) intends to evaluate the worldview series of English learning textbooks which are being taught at an Iranian military university foreign language center. The checklist was used as a tool for the data analysis. The results of this study can be helpful for ESL teachers and researchers as well as evaluators and ELT material developers. In the teaching and learning environment of the Mekong Delta, Nguyen (2015) conducted a study to assess English 6, an official textbook used for grade 6 students in all secondary schools throughout Vietnam. The results of this study demonstrate that the textbook is appropriate for the environment and culture of learning and teaching, helps teachers and students, and is well-received by both groups.

Some research has already been done to investigate the effective implementation of ESL through SNC in Pakistani schools (Irfan, 2021), to examine the gender representation and portrayal of males and females in SNC English textbooks (Grades: 2-5), to decode religious contents of Grade 5th Textbooks of SNC (Tayyab, 2022) and to explore various ethical and Pakistani cultural themes and ideologies such as ethics in school and home (Khan, 2022). Pirzada (2022) explores the weightage, importance, and values of nationalism and national integration that are given to the national heroes in the primary textbooks (English and Urdu books from grades 1 to 5). Asif (2021) works on the SNC textbooks for grades 1-5 to analyze the stereotypes and gender biases promoted in textbooks. The results show that gender inequality is aggressively promoted in the SNC textbooks, which will influence the beliefs and behaviors of the next generation.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The present research deals with the evaluation of subaltern practices in the English textbooks of SNC (Grades: 1-3). There is a dire need to check whether SNC is effective and fulfilling the requirements of our students or not. To achieve this purpose, the data on the SNC (Grades: 1-3) textbooks were taken from the official website of the Punjab Textbook Board (PTB). Overall, the present study follows a triangulation or mixed-method research approach. The CREDIBLE approach model (Mahboob, 2019) was applied to evaluate its eight features to interpret the results qualitatively. The subject teachers' response was also collected in the form of questionnaires

containing questions related to the CREDIBLE model. The results were evaluated further to cross-check and validate the findings obtained from the CREDIBLE model application.

The population of this research comprises two population groups. The first group includes English SNC textbooks (Grades: 1-3) as a population while 30 English language teachers (ELT) from both Govt. and private sector schools of Faisalabad, teaching the SNC syllabus constitute the second population group. The current study deals with two types of data. The first type includes textual data types present in the SNC English textbooks in scanned format. The second type of data was obtained from questionnaires to generalize the findings of the first population group. The purposive sampling method was used to evaluate the subaltern practices in SNC. Likewise, a simple random sampling method was used to collect ELT teachers' responses regarding the effectiveness of the English syllabus. The CREDIBLE approach model (Mahboob, 2019), was used as an analysis tool to evaluate the subaltern practices. This model has eight features **C**, contextually relevant, **R**, responds to practical needs, **E**, Engages stakeholders, **D**, draws on an understanding of local knowledge and practices, **I**, informed by diverse approaches and experiences, **B**, benefits local communities, **L**, leads the field/discipline and contributes to the larger and **E**, ethical. In the current research, this model is applied to SNC to judge whether the syllabi fulfill the needs of learners in terms of the 8 features of the CREDIBLE model.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

This section deals with the analysis of the SNC English textbooks (Grades: 1-3) and an interpretation of the obtained results based on the CREDIBLE Model (Mahboob, 2019).

4.1 CREDIBLE Results of English Textbook Grade 1

Grade one English textbook consists of 11 units that are based on 119 pages and this book is divided into four sections of activities (oral communication, reading and critical thinking, language focus and grammar, and creative writing). The grade one English textbook focuses on our four major skills: listening, speaking, reading, and writing. The researcher analyzes all activities one by one in this book. First of all the researcher analyzes the activity related to the oral communication section.

Table 4.1: Evaluation of Oral Communication in SNC English Textbook Grade 1

Unit	Title	Oral Communication	C	R	E	D	I	B	L	E
1	Time to Recall	Letter sounds	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2	My Family and I	Letter sound	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
		Learning to speak	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
3	Cobbler Cobbler	Consonant blends	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
		Greetings & routine social courtesies	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
4	Let's have Fun!	Consonant digraphs	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
		Listen & respond to command	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
5	Sharing is Caring	Words and sounds	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y
		Express limited needs	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
6	Blessings of Allah	Initial & ending sounds	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y

		Express basic emotions	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
7	Classroom Manners	Rhyming words Greetings and routine social courtesies	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
8	Nature is Beautiful	One-syllable words	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y
		Participate in conversation and take turn	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
9	The Greeting Card	Sight words Express needs	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
10	The Hare and Tortoise	/s/ & /z/ Sounds in Plurals Express enjoyment while playing	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
11	Love Animals	/s/ and /z/ sounds in plurals Body language	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y







Table 4.1 shows that the oral communication section of all units is contextually relevant, responds to the practical needs of the learners, and engages teachers with students. The student can understand syllable and rhyming words and all activities are ethically presented. In units 3 and 4, the oral communication activity did not respond to the practical need as learners cannot understand the concept of consonant blends and digraphs. Grade One learners cannot differentiate between different sounds so there is a need for specialized audio recordings of sounds so they can learn after listening through practice.

A) Oral Communication

1. Learning the Sounds



Letter Sounds

i. Match the pictures with the sounds

a NO
 u
 v
 j
 e
 s

ii. Read the given words and notice how different letters have different sounds in a word.


 f a n fan
 
 b o x box




 c u p cup
 
 n e t net

Figure 4.1: Example of Oral Communication Activity

The oral communication activity of the grade one English textbook is CREDIBLE except for chapters 2, 3, and 4 wherein this activity does not respond to the practical need of the learners. For



example, the above figure is contextually relevant but does not respond to the practical need of the learners because students can identify the elephant with the alphabet E but cannot identify with the sound. Here, the researcher suggests that syllabus designers should add the phonemes chart with letters for example e /ae/ and the sound of v, /v/ for better understanding of sounds.

Table 4.2: Evaluation of Reading and Critical Thinking Activity of Grade 1 Textbook

Unit	Reading and Critical Thinking	C	R	E	D	I	B	L	E
1	The alphabets	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2	Questions and answers Fill in the blanks	Y	N (students give answers in local language)	Y	Y	Y	N	L	Y
	Fill in blanks	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
3	Questions & answers	Y	N (students give answers in local language)	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
	Naming & action words Fill in blanks	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
4	Questions & answers	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
	Consonant blends	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
5	Questions & answers	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
6	Questions & answers	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
	Three letter words	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	Rearrange sentences	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
7	Questions & answers	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	Food labels Fill in blanks	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
8	Questions & answers Alphabetical order Brainstorming	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
9	Questions & answers	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
	The titles of book Choose correct answer	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
10	Questions & answers Fill in the blanks	Y	N (do not answer in English language)	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
11	Questions & answers Calendar Punctuation mark Fill in the blank	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y

Table 4.2 results show the reading and critical thinking activity in grade 1 English textbook does not respond to the practical needs of the students and does not benefit the learner. In grade 1, the majority of the students in government schools do not understand the English language. Even, they cannot read the lesson fluently and answer the comprehension questions due to a lack of



understanding of comprehension questions in English. They can hardly answer those questions in their local language or maybe just give a Yes and No response.

Pronouns (Substitution Words)

ii. Rearrange the given sentences correctly and circle the pronouns in them. Remember to start with the capital letter and end with a full stop.

- am cobbler I a _____
- a teacher are you _____
- my it black shoe is _____
- together we play _____
- a doctor he is. _____
- very is beautiful she. _____

Figure 4.2: Example of Activity Pronouns

A lot of things are mentioned in the above example of pronoun activity including identification of the pronoun, use of correct punctuation, and rearrangement of the sentence. In this activity, the teachers and students are engaged with each other during the class. The students cannot perform this activity in the classroom individually without their teacher’s assistance.

Table 4.3: The Evaluation of Language Focus and Grammar Activity in Grade 1 Textbook

Unit	Language focus and Grammar	C	R	E	D	I	B	L	E
1	Three-letter word	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2	Word meaning	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
	Sight words Nouns and pronouns	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
3	Word meaning	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
	Rhyming words Nouns and pronouns	Y	N (not rearrange sentences with punctuation mark)	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
4	Polite words Singular & plural nouns This & that Articles	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
5	Rhyming words Colour, shapes Masculine and feminine These and those	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y



	Articles								
6	Fruits & vegetable names Proper noun Questions Action words Omission of articles	Y	N (this is just for reading not for learning purposes. At this level students do not understand the ideas of omission of articles)	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
7	Objects in the classroom and at home	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	Wh-questions Use of 'is', 'am', 'are' of Adjective of size	Y	N(not identify itself and do not use the Adjective of size in their own writing)	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
8	Parts of body Use of 'is', 'am', 'are' Adjectives of quality Capitalization	Y	N (not understand the Adjectives of Quality and do no use in sentences)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
9	Ordinal numbers Adjective of colour The full stop Request	Y	N(grammar part is beyond the level of G-1 students)	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
10	Animal names Words showing possession Question mark and command	Y	N (not get the idea of Words showing possession and command)	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
11	Express limited needs Showing possession The comma	Y	N(this syllabus is beyond the learners need)	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y

Table 4.3 explains the activity on grammar, language focus, and vocabulary-related material. At this level, children cannot memorize the words with meaning and use them in their daily conversation. Some parts of this activity are beyond the level of learners because the majority of them cannot understand the English language. The grammar-related material is very difficult to understand for learners of grade one. Every unit of this book discusses new things like articles, omission of articles, words showing possession, command, and the concept of masculine and feminine including punctuation, and capitalization. After 3 or 4 units and at the end of the book, the review is given that consists of four sections of activities to check the learner’s knowledge acquired from the book. Children can solve some parts of the activity such as rhyming words, sight words, dialogue practice, and fill-in-the-blanks easily, but they may not solve other parts due to a lack of understanding of sounds, grammar parts, and especially comprehension questions because they can hardly write in their own words on the given topics at this level.

Table 4.4: The Evaluation of Writing Activity in Grade 1 Textbook

Unit	Writing	C	R	E	D	I	B	L	E
1	Pre-writing Alphabet Three-letter words	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2	One syllable word	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
3	Trace and copy sentences	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y

4	Write naming & action words	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
5	Write naming and action words	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
6	Write number in words	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	Creative writing	Y	N (do not write itself)	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
7	Listen items	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	Creative writing	Y	N (do not write itself)	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
8	Write date & captions Fill in blanks	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	Creative writing	Y	N (do not write itself)	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
9	Make & write a greeting card Write Name & Phone Number	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
10	Writing speech bubbles	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
11	Rhyming words	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	Creative writing	Y	N (do not write itself)	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y

Table 4.4 provides information regarding the evaluation of the writing activity in the grade 1 textbook. The results show that this activity has two parts, the first part is related to reading and copying the same words and sentences in the other column or notebook and the other part consists of creative writing. The first part of the activity is CREDIBLE except for the other parts. Grade one students are unable to write in their own words because they cannot think and brainstorm on the given topics. The education system in Pakistan is not independent of the learning system; they depend on books, key books, and other paper materials. So, our generation cannot think independently or write creatively but depend on cramming. These textbooks focus on the four skills listening, speaking, reading, and writing, but some parts of activities are difficult to understand for the learners of grade one. Some audio-video material should be provided to enhance learners' learning skills.

4.2 CREDIBLE Results of SNC English Textbook Grade 2

Grade 2 English textbook consists of 12 units that are based on 119 pages and this book is also divided into four sections of activities which are mentioned before. The findings indicate that the oral communication activity of the grade 2 textbook is according to the CREDIBLE approach model except in unit 11 on page number 105. Here, students may feel difficulty in understanding the weak form of articles 'a' and 'the'. Students can read orally but cannot identify in the written text. Most poems and lessons in the book are written by Western writers therefore they lack knowledge about our local, social, and cultural beliefs as in the poems 'Cricket' by Marjorie Barrows and 'Bee on my Nose' by R. Wayne Edwards. The addition of local knowledge may enhance the student's knowledge about religious beliefs and social practices.

The analysis of reading and critical thinking activity shows that students of Grade 2 can perform this activity in the classroom. It is contextually relevant and follows the cultural aspects. In Chapter 3, children can read sight words but cannot make sentences. In unit 8, students cannot brainstorm ideas and think critically or write independently. At this level, some students cannot answer the questions due to a lack of understanding of the English language. The reason is that they can only understand their local language and answer in the same language. Continuous practice on a daily basis can enhance their ability to answer those questions.

Table 4.5: Evaluation of Language Focus and Grammar Activity in Grade 2 Textbook



Unit	Language Focus and Grammar	C	R	E	D	I	B	L	E
1	Words meaning, rhyming words, Animal names, Introduce self & family, sight words Noun Pronoun	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2	Word meaning Syllable word Adjective Action words	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
3	Word meaning Fruits and vegetable names Singular plural	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	Position words	Y	N(not use them to make sentence)	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
4	Word meaning, polite words Rhyming words Use of 'is', 'am', 'are'	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	Pronoun as subjective case	Y	N(add the concept of this term)	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
5	Parts of body Sight words Prepositions Words show possession Articles	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
6	Objects in classroom & at home Masculine & feminine articles Omission	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
7	Colour, shapes, sight words Has and have Capitalization	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
8	Rhyming words and directions, proper noun and pointing words	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
9	Word meanings cardinal numbers Pronoun punctuation	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
10	Word meaning Ordinal number Question words Comma & Punctuation	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
11	Multi-step directions Commands	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y



	Requests								
12	Words to ask permission Question words	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y

Table 4.5 explains the language focus and grammar section activity. This activity is effective for the learners and also benefits the community if students can develop a complete understanding of the concept through practice. In some chapters as 2, 4, and 9, 10, students can only read the words like position words but cannot use them in making sentences. Likewise, there is the likelihood of doing mistakes while doing pronouns as a subjective case or cardinal numbers and ordinal numbers activities because the definitions of these terms are not added in the book for prior knowledge. Students cannot differentiate between numbers. The definition of the terms will also help the teacher to get the idea and explain it in front of the students in an easy way. In unit 10 at this level, students can hardly write 5 to 6 questions independently in their notebooks.


The results of the writing activity in grade 2 English textbook indicate that it is contextually relevant and follows the cultural aspects but does not respond to the needs of the learners or benefit our local community. In government schools, students cannot write and think critically. They can easily answer in the local language but neither speak English nor write a small paragraph by using different given words.

4.3 CREDIBLE Results of English Textbook Grade 3

The Grade 3 English textbook consists of 11 units and 127 pages with each unit contains four sections of activities.

Table 4.6: Evaluation of Oral Communication Activity in English Textbook Grade 3

Unit	Title	Oral Communication	C	R	E	D	I	B	L	E
1	Welcome	Soft sound of c and g	Y	N (not given the idea of sound)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
		Consonant cluster Courtesies to show respect Express greetings	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2	Gifts of Nature	Long & short vowels Trigraphs Recite a poem Describing events in a picture	Y	N (idea of short and long vowels given at the end of activity instead of start)	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y
3	The people I Love	Weak form of has, have Mark of exclamation Myself and my family	Y	N (not given the idea of weak and strong forms)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
4	Kindness to Children	Naat recitation Sounds of 'ch' words, Daily routine talk	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
5	Road Safety	Weak/strong form of do, does, and negative Express likes & dislikes	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
6	The Day of Silence	Silent 'b' sounds, Speech in bubbles about a place recently visited	Y	N (not understand the idea)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y



7	I Like to Play	Consonant cluster Express opinions Lead and follow	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
8	Saving Resources	Weak forms of 'do' and 'have' Public speaking	Y	N (do not write itself)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
9	My Culture-My Pride	Practice short e sound Respect & gratitude Magic word	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
10	Our Family Picnic	Consonant blends Talk on a picture	Y	R (do not identify in a text)	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y
11	Healthy Habits	Pronouns simple words with silent letters Pronouns syllables The stress of the word use of dictionary	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y

The above table shows the findings of the oral communication activity of the English textbook for grade 3. Units 1, 2, 3, 6, 8, and 10 do not respond to the practical needs of the learners. The definitions of different terms like trigraph, weak and strong forms of has, have, do, and does in different chapters are not mentioned. The addition of definitions may help the students to recall the concept of these terms. The idea of short and long vowels should be given at the start of the activity but in Unit 2, it is at the end of the activity on page 16. Here again, the addition of local content may enhance the student’s knowledge about local beliefs and social practices.

The language focus and grammar section contains activities like vocabulary building, learning spellings, and different parts of grammar such as conjunctions, contractions, adjectives, and prepositions. For instance, in units 6, 9, and 10 activities consist of the correct use of articles, contractions, and prepositions and the identification of tenses. At this level of learning, students cannot perform these tasks independently; they are confused by doing these activities. When students cannot understand and learn the activities then it will not be beneficial for our local community, so the focus should be on easy-to-learn activities.

Table 4.7: Evaluation of Writing Activity in Grade 3 Textbook

Unit	Writing	C	R	E	D	I	B	L	E
1	Syllable division and capitalization and punctuation Guided paragraph	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2	Numbers in words	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	Narrative paragraph Comic strips	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
3	Writing instructions and directions Guided paragraph	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
4	Basic elements of Story	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y



	writing Story writing on zoo Elephant								
5	Match signs with messages Describe pictures in own sentences	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
6	Writing information Character sketch	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
7	Mind map writing	Y	N(do not make a mind map & write in your own words)	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
	Analyzing pictures Invitation card	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
8	Calendar schedule Guided paragraph Writing posters	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
9	List festivals Expository paragraph	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
10	List of things Paragraph with clues	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
11	Response writing Process writing	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y

Table 4.7 findings give insight into the writing activity in grade 3 English textbook. In government schools, students cannot write in their own words independently on different topics and make mind maps, or brainstorm ideas. Students can understand only the local language and answer in their local language but cannot speak English or write a small paragraph by using different given words. After every 3 to 4 units, a review of previous unit activities is given for the assessment of the students but they can hardly solve it independently due to a lack of understanding of the English language.

4.4 Analysis of Selected SNC Textbooks Based on Material Senses

In everyday life, our sensory system is how we perceive and comprehend the tangible world, as well as how we relate to it. Our five sensory systems help us make sense of the world, and they interpret the many material incentives (light, sound, smell, touch, and taste) in light of a person's socio-semiotics and prior experiences. It should be emphasized that these sensory systems frequently cooperate with one another and are not entirely independent of one another. Additionally, not everyone has access to or uses all of the sensory systems in the same manner. And how our material-biological self relates to our socio-semiotic self through our sensory systems.

Table 4.8: Activities based on Material Senses in SNC Textbook

Grade	Sight	Sound	Smell	Touch	Taste
1	17	16	0	0	0
2	21	20	0	0	0
3	11	11	0	0	0

Table 4.13 provides an overview of which material activities are present in the English textbooks of (Grade: 1-3). The grade one English textbook consists of 11 units and 17 activities are related to sight and 16 are related to sound, grade two textbooks consist of 12 units, and 21 activities are related to sight and 20 are sound. Grade three English textbook contains 11 units and 11 activities are about sound and 11 are sight. The Pakistani education system is still focusing on these two senses (sight and sound) and neglecting the other three senses (smell, touch, and taste).

4.5 Findings of English Teachers' Response Regarding SNC Effectiveness



English language teachers who have been teaching the SNC syllabus were selected to get the responses to check the credibility and effectiveness of the SNC syllabus through 30 questionnaires that were filled.

Table 4.9: Percentage of ELT Teachers' Responses Regarding the Credibility of SNC

Sr. No	Questions	Responses			
		YES	YES %	NO	NO %
1	Is the SNC English textbook that you teach contextually relevant?	27	90	3	10
2	Are there any interactive and task-based activities that require students to use new vocabulary to communicate?	15	50	15	50
3	Do students converse in dialogue and sound activity easily in your class?	9	30	21	70
4	Do students solve grammar-related questions in your class?	12	40	18	60
5	Do your students answer reading comprehension questions easily?	7	23.3	23	76.7
6	Does the SNC English textbook supply sufficient information on our local knowledge?	6	20	24	80
7	Does the textbook supply sufficient knowledge of our religious beliefs?	13	43.3	17	56.7
8	Does the textbook supply sufficient knowledge of our social practices?	26	86.6	4	13.4
9	Does the current SNC syllabus respond to the practical needs of the learners?	8	26.6	22	73.4
10	Is the current SNC English textbook syllabus beneficial to the local community?	11	36.6	19	63.4
11	Do the SNC English textbooks contribute in developing the learners into global citizens?	20	66.6	10	33.4
12	Is the SNC syllabus ethical?	30	100	0	0

Table 4.9 indicates the responses to the ELT teacher questionnaire related to the activities part showed that 90% of teachers agreed that SNC English textbooks of (Grade: 1-3) are contextually relevant. According to the table, 30% of teachers assume that students are engaged in classroom activities and converse with friends and 70% of teachers said that they do not perform well. The results showed that the majority of teachers' answers are NO because all these activities (oral communication, reading, critical thinking, language focus and grammar, and writing) do not fulfill the needs of the learners. According to questions 6, 7, and 8, the focus is on local, and religious beliefs and social practices. 80% of teachers said that SNC English textbooks do not focus on local beliefs because these textbooks provide insufficient knowledge and information about local beliefs. Meanwhile, 56.7% of teachers said that SNC English textbooks do not focus on religious beliefs. In teachers' responses on social practices, 86.6% said that SNC English textbooks (Grades: 1-3) focused on social practices. For example, these books show the social roles of doctors, teachers, traffic wardens, and cobblers. Additionally, 63.4% of teachers said that SNC English textbooks are beneficial for the learners but this is a multi-skill task syllabus that is beyond the level of learners and difficult to understand for the learners of primary level and students cannot perform all the activities at the same time. When it comes to the questions related to ethics, all the teachers answered YES because all the material in SNC English textbooks is ethical. Most of the classrooms are learner-centered and teachers still follow the grammar-translation method.



FURTHER DISCUSSION

The first question evaluates the contextual relevancy and effectiveness of activities in terms of the CREDIBLE Approach Model. The findings of the part (a) show that SNC English textbooks from grades 1-3 are contextually relevant while the activities and content of the books correlate with each other. Part (b) results indicate that all four activities do not respond to the practical needs of the learners at some stages in grade 1. Meanwhile, the oral communication activity does not fulfill the needs of the learner (see Table 4.1). Conversely, the oral communication activity in the grade 2 textbook fulfills the needs of the learners as most of the concepts are repeated and learners can perform these activities with practice. The same activity in the grade 3 textbook is also difficult for learners due to the confusion in differentiating sounds. The material of the second activity 'reading and critical thinking' is relevant but does not fulfill the practical needs of the learners because learners cannot answer the questions due to a lack of understanding. Djedjiga (2017) conducted a similar study to investigate the development of reading strategies through activities in the middle-level English textbook. The results showed a similarity with current results of the reading and understanding comprehension section concluding that 50% of students face difficulty in understanding the content of their textbooks. The findings further showed that 76% of teachers said that students cannot read the text fluently or accurately and cannot understand the comprehension questions in the English language. Part (c) explores whether English textbooks of the selected grades are culturally compatible and provide ethical content or not. The findings reveal that the content of all three English textbooks is culturally appropriate and contain ethical and moral values.

Part (d) is related to the evaluation of SNC in terms of local and social practices or beliefs. According to findings, SNC English textbooks do not focus on our local knowledge or beliefs as poems in the books are written by Western writers that portray their social and local practices (Table 4.1). Syllabus designers should add poems of Pakistani writers written in simple language according to the understanding level and needs of the learners. The major focus of the SNC content should be on providing local knowledge and a minor on Western knowledge. Part (e) findings indicate that SNC English textbooks are somehow effective but do not benefit our students, the main part of the local community, because these activities do not fulfill the needs of the learners. For instance, in the writing section of English grade 1, students cannot write an essay on different topics, make a mind map, and brainstorm ideas. They can hardly learn the vocabulary items because words that are used in the vocabulary portion are difficult to pronounce and memorize with meanings for grade 1 and 2 students (see Table 4.3, 4.5). It is also difficult for them to understand the different parts of grammar.

The second question deals with the subaltern practices that are prominent in SNC English language textbooks e.g. material and socio-semiotic senses. Two material senses e.g. sight and sound are prominent in the SNC English textbooks. Mahboob and Cheng (2019), explain that most of the education systems of South Asian countries focus on sight and sound-related senses. The findings of the current study indicate that though it is a multi-skilled syllabus still the SNC textbooks only focus on sight and sound senses ignoring the other three material senses. Syllabus designers should focus on adding activities related to touch, taste, and smell senses.

The questionnaire results show the teacher's attitudes toward the different sections of activities that are included in the English textbooks (Grades: 1-3). The result obtained from teachers' questionnaires indicates that 90% of the teachers agreed that the SNC English textbooks are contextually relevant. Meanwhile, 10% of teachers believed that SNC textbooks are not contextually relevant. The results from the CREDIBLE model resemble the results of the teachers' questionnaires. The instances of the current study showed that 50% of teachers agreed that task-based activities are helpful for the learners' understanding. In a similar research by Djedjiga (2017), the questionnaire results showed that 81.25% of teachers believe that task-based and interactive activities had an important role in the learners' comprehension of the texts, and this led to the use of new vocabulary items. According to the questionnaire's findings, 76.7% of teachers agreed that the majority of students do not understand the English language. Even the students of grade 1



cannot read the text from the book so they cannot understand the questions and are unable to answer those questions. They can understand the concept only in their local language and can answer in a single word. Meanwhile, 23.3% of teachers said that the students in grades two and three can understand the reading comprehension activity and answer the questions in the English language because the PTB introduced the Literacy Numeracy Drive (LND) which is helpful for the learners. Through this app, students can practice all the activities, improve their vocabulary and perform well in classrooms and exams.

According to questionnaire results, 36.6% of teachers responded that the current SNC is beneficial for the learners but the majority of them (63.4%) believed that the quantity of syllabus is very high for the beginning levels therefore students face many difficulties in understanding the concepts and they cannot perform the activities well in classrooms. The activities related to grammar are difficult to understand and memorize, especially the grammatical terms like articles, punctuation, capitalization, etc. at Grade-1. At this level, students cannot perform different tasks at the same time. Meanwhile, 80% of teachers believe that these books do not focus on our local beliefs or represent Pakistani culture. Almost 56.7% of teachers think that SNC English textbooks lack knowledge about our religious events and history such as Rabi-ul-Awal, Eid-ul-Fittir, Eid-ul-Azha, Hajj, etc. while 86.6% of teachers agreed that the SNC syllabus discusses our social practices like cobbler, doctor, teacher, and traffic warden.


The majority of the teachers stressed that the syllabus does not respond to the needs of the learners (73.4%) while 26.6% assume that SNC is fulfilling the needs of the learners. This means the SNC syllabus may not prove beneficial for the community. So, here the results of the questionnaire are different from the CREDIBLE results. Meanwhile, 66.6% of teachers responded that the SNC syllabus is beneficial for our learners and prepares to enable them to become a part of the global community. All the material in the English textbooks of SNC (Grades: 1-3) is ethical.

5. CONCLUSION

The present research aims to evaluate the different sections of activities in the SNC English textbooks (Grades: 1-3) to investigate the appropriateness of activities, contextual relevancy, and benefits for local communities. A CREDIBLE approach model was applied to the SNC syllabus to check the level of its effectiveness for learners. Additionally, ELT teachers' response regarding the SNC syllabus was also collected through questionnaires. The findings from both the CREDIBLE model and the teacher's response revealed that though the English textbooks (Grades: 1-3) are contextually relevant still some parts of the activities are beyond the level of learners so it can be concluded that revision in some parts of the SNC syllabus may make it more beneficial for local community. The current study is a significant contribution for syllabus designers, teachers, and researchers, as it will serve as a base for further research on textbook analysis. Future researchers can also apply the CREDIBLE model using different methods such as interviews, and classroom observation to check the credibility of the syllabus of O-levels and A-levels in addition to other SNC books.

REFERENCES

- [1] Ali, A., Deeba, F., Ajmal, M. (2021). *An Evaluation of English Textbook at Primary Level in Punjab, Pakistan*. *Pakistan Languages & Humanities Review*, 5(II), 293-309.
- [2] Alsulami, Y. A. K. (2021). *An Evaluation of a Fourth Level English Textbook Used in Secondary Schools in Riyadh City*. *English Language Teaching*, 14(2), 68.
- [3] Asif, M. (2021). *Gender stereotypes in the Single National Curriculum, Pakistan*. *International Journal on Women Empowerment*, 7(1), 47-59.
- [4] Djedjiga, F., & Chabha, M. (2017). *Textbook Evaluation: Investigating the Development of the Reading Strategies through the Activities of My Book of English*. Ministry of Higher Education and Scientific Research.
- [5] Irfan, H. (2021). *Insightful Perspectives about Effective Implementation of ESL Single National Curriculum (SNC) in Pakistani Schools*. *Pakistan Social Sciences Review*, 5(1), 975-986.

- 
- [6] Jahan, K., Mukhtar, S., Yasmin, F., & Mushtaq, M. (2020). An Evaluation of English Textbook for Grade- 6: Application of Communicative Approach. *International Journal of Psychosocial Rehabilitation*, 24(07).
- [7] Khalili, M., Jodai, H. (2012). Evaluation of WorldView Textbooks: Textbooks Taught at a Military University. *The University of Guilan -Iran*.
- [8] Khan, Y. M., & Ali, A. (2022). Exploring Ideologies in Primary English Textbook (SNC-2020): A Critical Discourse Analysis. *Perennial Journal of History*, 3(1), 35-48.
- [9] Mahboob, A., & Cheng, L. (2019). Chapter 3: CREDIBLE Research and Positive Discourse Analysis. *Doing Subaltern Education*.
- [10] McDonough, J., Shaw, C., & Masuhara, H. (2013). *Materials and methods in ELT: A teacher's guide (3rded)*. West Sussex: Willey-Blackwell.
- [11] Mohammadi, M., & Abdi, H. (2014). Textbook Evaluation: A Case Study. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, Vol98, 1148-1155.
- [12] Nguyen, T. C. (2015). An Evaluation of the Textbook English 6: A case study from secondary schools in the Mekong Delta Provinces of Vietnam: *The University of Sheffield*.
- [13] Pirzada, G., Aslam, A., & Ahmed, F. (2022). The Dearth of National Heroes in Pakistan's Primary Curriculum: from the Previously Prescribed Curriculum to the Newly Implemented Single National Curriculum. *Pakistan Journal of Social Research*, 4(03), 771-779.
- [14] Tayyab, M., Umer, S., & Sajid, A. (2022). Decoding Religious Contents of Grade 5th Textbooks of Single National Curriculum (SNC) in Pakistan. *Pakistan Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 10(1), 291-297.
- [15] Waheed, B., Anwer, B., & Ahmed, Z. (2021). Evaluation of Local Cultural Aspects in Pakistani English Textbook at Intermediate Level. *International research Journal of arts and humanities*, Vol45, 155-162.