AN ANALYTICAL EXPLORATION OF FINDING OUT EFFECTS OF REINFORCING FACTORS ON HUMAN TRAFFICKING IN PAKISTAN: PERSPECTIVE OF LAW ENFORCEMENT OFFICIALS AND LAWYERS IN TWIN CITIES OF RAWALPINDI AND ISLAMABAD

[1]DR. MUHAMMAD ATIQUE KHAN, [2]DR. NASIM KHAN MAHSUD, [3]DR. NUDRAT MUSHTAQ

[1]Assistant Professor, Kahuta Law College
[2]Assistant Professor, Dept. of Sociology-Allama Iqbal Open University-AIOU, Islamabad
Corresponding Author, Email: nasim.khan@aiou.edu.pk
[3]Assistant Professor, Dept. of Sociology-Sardar Bahadur Khan Women University-Quetta

Abstract -*Human trafficking is a very crucial and important topic in Pakistan. The study is an attempt to understand human trafficking in Pakistan. The right to freedom of movement is almost given in the constitution of every country of the world. It was another thing that these laws were very often followed by the countries of the world themselves. In developing countries like Pakistan where per capita income is very low and illiteracy prevailed everywhere, human trafficking has become a burning issue. This phenomenon drew the attention of social thinkers on the one hand and law enforcement officers and agencies on the other. The main aim of this study was to highlight the issue of human trafficking in the context of labor and sex trafficking in Pakistan. The purpose of the present study was to investigate reinforcing factors in the context of human trafficking in Pakistan. The study employed a quantitative research design. A well-designed structured questionnaire was used to collect the data from the respondents. The data were collected from 95 respondents through purposive sampling. Human trafficking has emerged as a very serious matter in developing countries like Pakistan. A lot of people are trafficked from Pakistan on a daily basis for the purpose of sex and labor trafficking. Uni, bivariate, and multiple variate analysis were used in the present research. Multiple regression (Stepwise method of MLR) was used by keeping in view the diverse cultural setting of the country. The study found that reinforcing factors play a vital role in human trafficking. There is a dire need for the implementation of laws regarding human trafficking and also given exemplary punishments for those who are involved in it.*

Keywords: *Reinforcing factors, human trafficking, lawyers, Federal Investigation Agency (FIA), Police of Pakistan.*

INTRODUCTION

According to the United States Department of State Trafficking in Persons Report (2016) Pakistan has been placed under Tier 2 Watch List for the third consecutive year which indicates that the Government of Pakistan has not been able to take some serious steps to address the issue of human trafficking in the country. "Illegal movement of the individuals for the exploitive commercial sex or labor is called human trafficking". The crimes of human trafficking have increased during the previous twenty years dramatically. The crimes are disliked by ever citizen of the developed and undeveloped country. No one can appreciate this social evil in any country of the world. To safeguard the society from this evil some serious steps must be taken by the governments and non-government organizations of the world (Farrell & Fahy, 2009). At least 600,000 to 800,000 people are trafficked every year on all over the. In United States of America human trafficking is increasing day by day and in 2010 the total victims of human trafficking were about 14,600 to 17,500. (Farrel et al., 2010).

The criminal gangs' active in Pakistan earned approximately 927 Million US dollars in 2013. Interior ministry of Pakistan said that over one thousand criminal gangs were active in Pakistan in the illegal human trafficking and immigrant smuggling. Data presented in the report indicate a constant

increase in the profits of the criminal networks from 797 million dollars in 2007 to 927 million dollars in 2013 (Reichel & Albanes, 2013). The crime of human trafficking affects almost every country in the world. Neither the developing nor developed countries are safe from the curse of human trafficking. The more vulnerable countries in the human trafficking are those countries whom per capita income is low. When the people are unable to possess the basic needs of life then the people of that country are more likely to be deceived by the human traffickers. The country like Pakistan is more prone to the crimes like human trafficking because the per capita income of the people of Pakistan is low. The personnel in Pakistan with less income are more likely to be deceived by the human traffickers (Askola, 2007).

The human trafficking has drawn the attention of the scholars because it seems to be the theft of a new kind. The human trafficking is against the basic principles and rights of human beings. Almost every constitution of the world specifies the rights of life, right of property, freedom of speech, freedom of movement and the right to enjoy the property as the primary rights of its citizens. Whenever someone commits the act of human trafficking, it indicates that the victim has been deprived of all the basic rights of being a citizen of any country, usually this unlawful act is committed with the use of force, coercion and involves fraud (Azeem, 2017).

LITERATURE REVIEW

Reinforcing factors state that perpetrators of human trafficking are rational beings who make decisions to commit the acts of crime based on the costs and benefits involved in the process of commission of crime. Basically, it is deterministic in nature; criminal decision making process is based on free will which emphasized that the element of hedonism is active in this regard. Hedonism implies the element of pain and pleasure in the commission of any crime. It is the authority of the government which can promote or decrease the acts of human trafficking. Inability of the government of Pakistan to legislate good laws in order to overcome on the acts of human trafficking is reinforcing the acts of human trafficking (Lanier, & Henry, 2004). Increase in punishment can prove a major source in order to decrease the acts of any type of criminality. Usually, it is the power of the government which can legislate good laws in order to decrease the acts of human trafficking. Ability of the government to formulate and legislate severe punishments will decrease the chances of human trafficking in Pakistan (Benson & Cullen, 1988; Payne, 2003; Podgor, 2007).

Vulnerability of the victims leads to human trafficking (Lanier, & Henry, 2004). Levitt (2001) also focused on the vulnerability of the victims which are created by the governments especially while spending on law enforcement agencies during elections only. The act of not spending on law enforcement agencies on continue basis provide opportunities to the criminals to commit trafficking. Incapability of officials will reinforce criminals to select vulnerable targets.

Less expenses on the victim is such a reinforcing factor which stimulates the traffickers to commit the crimes of human trafficking on all over the world including Pakistan. The most important reinforcing elements in the commission of crime like human trafficking are the gains of traffickers and the vulnerability of the victim among potential victims of the targeted population. Trafficking also involves the skills to commit the crime of human trafficking. Bittner (1967) and Askola (2007) also elucidated that the learning skills to commit any act of crime are such a reinforcing factor which instigates the acts of human trafficking in Pakistan.

Less severe punishment is such a reinforcing factor which has increased the incidences of human trafficking in the countries. The situation of less severe punishment is becoming worse and worse in Pakistan day by day which is causing human trafficking in the Pakistani society. Severe punishment of the criminals of any crime were presented while presenting examples of earlier punishments of criminals. Earlier severe punishments caused to decrease in crime (Rail & Harvey, 1995; Reichel & Albanes, 2013).

OBJECTIVE

- To investigate the reinforcing factors with reference to human trafficking in Pakistan.

HYPOTHESIS

- Hypothesis 1: Reinforcing factors are positively associated with human trafficking.

Index Variable

Serial no	Variables	No of items	Minimum value	Maximum value	Reliability
1	Reinforcing Factors	06	13	28	.80
2	Exposure to human trafficking	04	10	19	.70

In order to study the combined effect of all the variables in predicting the response variable, all the statements in matrix questions are combined in order to form a single or main variable known as the index variable. In other words, it is the prerequisite to make sure the components of consistency among all the items in the matrix question. In the index variable, a reliability check is carried out and the Cronbach Alpha value is determined. In the assessment of reliability if all the values of Alpha remain in the range of 0 to 1.0 it indicates that all items, statements or matrix questions are highly correlated and represent single idea. Index of variables is as under; Reinforcing factors: No of items=06, minimum value=13, maximum value=28 and reliability =.800. Social factors: No of items= 05, minimum value=08, maximum value=32 and reliability =.652. Economic factors: No of items= 05, minimum value=11, maximum value=23 and reliability =.610. Exposure to human trafficking: No of items= 04, minimum value=10, maximum value=19 and reliability =.70.

CONCEPTUALIZATION

Back ground variables	Independent variables	Dependent variable
1. Age (Herzfeld, 2002). 2. Region (Clawson, Layne, & Small, 2006).	Reinforcing factors:- Factors are less severe punishments, vulnerability of victims, inability of governments to legislate good laws, less conscientious people, less expensive victims and learning skills which stimulate to human trafficking (Akerlof, & Yellen, 1994; Levitt, 2001).	Exposure to human trafficking Askola (2007). Factors are as under: Fewer punishment, lack of education, fewer expenses on criminal proceedings & inequality within groups.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The data were collected from 95 respondents of Rawalpindi and Islamabad. The occupation of respondents revealed that most of the respondents (37.9%) were police officials of the rank of sub inspector to superintendent of police, (31.6%) were lawyers and (30.5%) were FIA officials of the rank of sub inspector to inspector. The interview places included FIA headquarters Islamabad, I-9 Police Station (Thana), Koral Chowk Police Station, Check Shahzad Police Station, Police Station Sadar Rawalpindi, Chountra Police Station, Waris town Police Station, Rawat Police Station, Police Training School Sehala Rawalpindi, Kachery Rawalpindi and the lawyers of Islamabad high court bar. The data showed that majority of the respondents (61.1%) belonged to Rawalpindi and (38.9%) of the respondents belonged to Islamabad. The gender of respondents showed that two third (66.3%) of the respondents were male and 33.7 % of the respondents were female.

The study was quantitative in nature. Respondents were selected through purposive sampling technique. Keeping in view the purpose of the study, purposive sampling was used. Major purpose of selecting the law enforcing officials and lawyers was to select those particular officials and lawyers who had been dealing with the cases of trafficking in Rawalpindi and Islamabad. Justification to choose the purposive sampling was to select only those respondents who had some sort of exposure or experience to deal with the cases of trafficking in two big cities of Pakistan namely Rawalpindi and Islamabad. Participants were assured that the data was only for the research purpose and will remain confidential. Structured questionnaire with closed ended

questions was used as a research instrument. A reference letter was taken by the researcher from the International Islamic University Islamabad. The respondents were not ready to give a response without the reference letter of IIUI. The purpose of the study was conveyed to the officials of the Federal Investigation Agency, police, and lawyers. The issue of trafficking demands the study of the whole of Pakistan but keeping in view the limitations of time and finance only two big cities of Pakistan namely Rawalpindi & Islamabad were purposively focused. The data was analyzed with the help of univariate, bivariate, and multivariate analysis. All the tests were conducted after having read the assumptions of correlation, ANOVA, and multiple linear regression.

UNIVARIATE ANALYSIS
PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF RESPONDENTS REGARDING REINFORCING FACTORS

Statements	SA=1 %age.	A=2 %age	N=3 %age	DA=4 %age	SDA=5 %age	Mean	Std. Deviation
Less severe punishment stimulates to human trafficking.	6.3	47.4	22.1	13.7	10.5	3.25	1.110
Vulnerability of victim leads to human trafficking.	11.6	52.6	29.5	5.3	1.1	3.68	.789
Inability of government to legislate good laws reinforces to human trafficking	2.1	34.7	53.7	8.4	1.1	3.28	.694
Less conscientious personnel are more likely to commit the crimes of human trafficking.	3.2	27.4	49.5	20.0		3.13	.766
Less expensive victims are easily trafficked.	7.4	36.8	30.5	25.3		3.26	.924
Learning skills instigate to human trafficking.	9.5	38.9	28.4	21.1	2.1	3.32	.983

The question regarding less severe punishment and human trafficking revealed that most of the respondents (47.2%) agreed, (22.1%) of the respondents remained neutral, (13.7%) of the respondents disagreed, (10.5%) of the respondents strongly disagreed and some (6.3%) of the respondents strongly agreed. The question regarding vulnerability of victim and human trafficking showed that majority of the respondents (52.6%) agreed to the statement, (29.5%) of the respondents remained neutral, (11.6%) of the respondents strongly agreed to the statement, (5.3%) of the respondents disagreed and (1.1%) of the respondents strongly disagreed to the statement. The question regarding inability of the government to legislate good laws and human trafficking revealed that most of the respondents (53.7%) remained neutral, (34.7%) of the respondents agreed, (8.4%) of the respondents disagreed, (2.1%) of the respondents strongly agreed and (1.1%) of the respondents strongly disagreed to the statement.

The question regarding less conscientious personnel are more likely to commit the crimes of human trafficking showed that most of the respondents (49.5%) remained neutral, (27.4 %) of the respondents agreed, (20%) of the respondents disagreed and (3.1%) of the respondents strongly agreed to the statement. The question regarding less expensive victims are easily trafficked revealed that most of the respondents (36.8%) agreed, (30.5%) of the respondents remained neutral, (25.3%) of the respondents disagreed and (7.4%) of the respondents strongly agreed to the statement. The question regarding learning skills instigate to human trafficking showed majority of the respondents (38.9%) agreed to the statement, (28.4%) of the respondents remained neutral, (21.1%) of the respondents disagreed, (9.5%) of the respondents strongly agreed to the statement and (2.1%) of the respondents strongly disagreed to the statement.

DISCUSSION

The findings regarding less severe punishment and human trafficking revealed that a little less than half (47.2%) of the respondents were agreed. The results supported the findings of (Rail G. & Harvey, 1995) who said that earlier barbaric and public punishment used to stop the offenders from repeating criminality due to humiliation. The punishment must be severe in order to prevent the future criminality. The findings regarding vulnerability of victim and human trafficking showed that majority of the respondents (52.6 %) agreed. The results supported the findings of (Hughes, 2004) who stated that criminals might be stopped by making the target hard. The findings regarding inability of the government to legislate good laws and human trafficking revealed that the most of the respondents (53.7 %) remained neutral but at the same time 34.7 % of the respondents agreed. The results supported the findings of (Hughes, 2004, Lanier, & Henry, 2004, Payne, 2003, & Podgor, 2007 and Benson, & Cullen, 1988) all said that inability of the government to legislate good laws is contributing the acts of trafficking. The findings regarding less conscientious personnel are more likely to commit the crimes of human trafficking showed that most of the respondents (49.5%) remained neutral but the second highest percentage (27.4 %) of the respondents agreed to the statement. The results supported the findings of (Wheaton, Schauer, & Galli (2010), who stated that developing countries are paradise of human trafficking. The findings regarding less expensive victims are easily trafficked revealed that most of the respondents (36.8 %) agreed. The results supported the findings of (Lanier, & Henry, 2004) who said that in expensive victims are more likely to be trafficked from one place to other place. The findings regarding learning skills instigate to human trafficking showed majority of the respondents (38.9%) agreed to the statement. The results supported the findings of (Brown, Esbensen, and Geis, 2008) who stated that learning of skill was instigating the perpetrators more in the acts of crime and especially the human trafficking.

BI VARIATE ANALYSIS
CORRELATIONAL ANALYSIS BETWEEN STUDY VARIABLES AND HUMAN TRAFFICKING

Variables	Human Trafficking	P Value
RF	.452[**]	.000

Note * p<.05 ** p<.01, RF=Reinforcing factors.

Now, researcher intends to apply Multiple Regression Analysis. So, the assumption regarding variables are not to be highly correlated will be tested by Analysis of Variance. So, the ANOVA test showed results as under:-

ANOVA TEST

Variables	SSbn	SSwn	Dfbn	dfwn	MSSbn	MSSwn	F	Sig.
RF	252.937	376.368	14	80	18.067	4.705	3.840	.000

Note RF= Reinforcing Factors, SS_{bn} = Sum of Squares between the groups, $SS_{wn=}$ Sum of Squares within groups, $Df_{bn=}$ degree of freedom between the groups, $df_{wn=}$ degree of freedom within groups, $MSS_{bn=}$ Mean Square between the groups, $MSS_{wn=}$Mean Square within the groups, F=obtained frequency which is equal to Mean Square between groups divided by Mean Square within groups and Sig=Significant. Reinforcing factors (RF) and human trafficking (HT) had Sum of Square between groups (*252.937*), Sum of Square within groups was (*376.368*), degree of freedom between groups was 14, degree of freedom within groups was 80. Degree of freedom total = N-1. Here, N was 95 and df = 95-1=94. Whenever, SS is computed treat the experiment is treated as one sample. Therefore df=N-1. Mean Square between the groups was (18.067), Mean Square within the groups was (4.705). Mean Sum of Square shows actual variance in the sample. F which is equal to Mean Square between groups divided by Mean Square within groups= 18.067/4.705= 3.840 which is not less than 1 which implies that Null hypothesis is not true and researcher accepts the alternate hypothesis that there is relationship between the factor and response variable and at the same time the result is significant at .000 level. So, the researcher rejects the Null hypothesis of no

relationship between predictor and response variable and accepts the alternate hypothesis that a relationship exists between the variables.

MULTIPLE VARIATE ANALYSIS
PREDICTORS EXPLAINING THE VARIANCE WITH CRITERION VARIABLE HUMAN TRAFFICKING (MULTIPLE LINEAR REGRESSION STEP WISE METHOD)

	β (Standardized Coefficients)
Predictors	1
RF	.517***
F Test	33.913
R^2	.267

Predictors; Note RF= Reinforcing Factors. The result showed that there were (Std. Residual Min = -2.153, Std. Residual Max = 4.539). Similarly, Durbin-Watson test was also conducted in order to see the independent error. The data also met the assumption of the independent errors. The value of Durbin-Watson test (1.94) was also in the normal range ($\pm$ 1.50). Therefore, the model met the assumption of the independent errors.

FTEST OF THE STUDY VARIABLES
Whenever, second predictor is added, the R-Squared change is tested with an "F" test. "F" test is referred to as F change. Significant "F" change means that the variables added in that step significantly improve the prediction. Result showed that "F" tests in the present research were (33.913) with respect to reinforcing factors.

Excluded Variables; Background variables: Result showed that Reinforcing factors (RF) had (β1=.517, p=.000), Standardized Coefficient is also called Beta coefficient or Beta weights. Beta Coefficient is the estimates resulting from Regression analysis where underlying data has been standardized so that the variance of dependent and predictor variable is equal to 1. Standardized Coefficients are the slopes in standardized units i.e. to know number of standard deviations.

SUMMARY MODEL

S. No	1
R	.517[a]
R Square	.267
Adjusted R	.259
Standard Error of the Estimate	2.22678

"R" is called value of Regression Coefficient. Result portrayed that the values of Correlation in MLR were .517[a]. "R" is considered one measure of the quality of prediction in criterion variable. Stepwise analysis is the analysis of the variables at each step. So, at the first step the prediction remains .517[a] The above mentioned value show that there is good level of prediction in the predictors to happen the criterion variable (human trafficking).

R-Square in the present research was and .350. R-Square highlights R-Square value which is called Coefficient of determination. R-Square is the proportion of variance in the criterion variable. The proportion of variance in criterion variable is explained by the predictor variables. The proportion of variation accounted for by the regression model above and beyond the mean model. In the present research, the value of R^2= (.267) shows that the predictors explained 26.7% of the variability of the criterion or response variable namely human trafficking.

The Adjusted R- Squared tells the percentage of variation explained by only the predictor variables that actually affect the criterion variable. Adjusted R- Squared is also known as shrunken R-Squared. Adjusted R- Squared is unbiased estimator of the population P2. As it is known from the

table that adjusted R- Squared in the present research is (.259) or it is (25.9%) of variation explained by the predictor reinforcing factors. The standard error is the average amount of mistake or error which researcher can face in actual condition. Researcher may wrong in predicting the criterion variable at the level of (2.22678).

CONCLUSION

The study concludes that human trafficking is emerging as one of the important field to be investigated. A large number of people are trafficked from the Pakistan for the purpose of labor and sex. Fabricated statements are made to the victims of labor and sex trafficking. The victims are easily trapped by the perpetrators due to prevailing economic deprivation. Per capita income of the people of Pakistan is very low as compare to other countries in the region. People are ambitious to earn a sound amount in order to keep the standard of their family high. Hope for high standard reinforces the less conscientious people to traffic the people. Laws to eradicate the curse of human trafficking are not sufficient. Rise in economic condition of people of Pakistan may decrease the acts of human trafficking in Pakistan. There is a need to legislate strict criminal laws in Pakistan to eradicate this prevailing curse of human trafficking. Short and long term policies of the government and civil society are required to eradicate the crimes of human trafficking from Pakistan. The programs to create general awareness among people of Pakistan must be disseminated through media (print and electronic) regarding adverse impacts of human trafficking. Prevailing illiteracy and poverty are causing human trafficking to a great extent. Government of Pakistan and common people must focus much to abolish the chances of human trafficking in Pakistan. The result showed that reinforcing factors are more stimulating to the acts of human trafficking in Pakistan.

REFERENCES

[1]   Akerlof, G., & Yellen, J. L. (1994). *Gang behavior, law enforcement, and community values*. Washington, DC: Canadian Institute for Advanced Research.
[2]   Askola, H. (2007). Violence against women, trafficking, and migration in the European Union. *European Law Journal, 13*(2), 204-217.
[3]   Azeem, M. (2017). *Law Under Bhutto's Socialism (1970-1980s)*. In Law, State and   Inequality in Pakistan (pp. 103-153). Springer, Singapore.
[4]   Benson, M. L., & Cullen, F. T. (1988). The special sensitivity of white-collar offenders to prison: A critique and research agenda. *Journal of Criminal Justice, 16*(3), 207-215.
[5]   Bittner, E. (1967). The police on skid-row: A study of peace keeping. *American sociological review*, 69 (9), 7-15.
[6]   Clawson, H. J., Layne, M., & Smalls, K. (2007). *Estimating human trafficking into the United States: development of a methodology: final phase two report*. Fairfax, VA: ICF International.
[7]   Brown, S. E., Esbensen, F. A., & Geis, G. (2008). *Criminology: Explaining crime and its context*. Cincinnati: Anderson.
[8]   Farrell, A., & Fahy, S. (2009). The problem of human trafficking in the US: Public frames and policy responses. *Journal of Criminal Justice, 37*(6), 617-626.
[9]   Farrell, A., McDevitt, J., & Fahy, S. (2010). Where are all the victims?. *Criminology & Public Policy, 9*(2), 201-233.
[10]   Herzfeld, B. (2002). Slavery and gender: women's double exploitation. *Gender & Development, 10*(1), 50-55.
[11]   Hughes, D. M. (2004). *The Demand: Where Sex Trafficking Begins. A Call to Action: Joining the Fight Against Trafficking in Persons*.
[12]   Lanier, M. M., & Henry, S. (2004). Essential Criminology, Colorado. *USA*: Westview.
[13]   Levitt, S. D. (2001). Alternative strategies for identifying the link between unemployment and crime. *Journal of quantitative criminology, 17*(4), 377-390.

[14] Payne, B. K. (2003). *Incarcerating white-collar offenders: The prison experience and beyond*: Charles C Thomas Publisher.

[15] Podgor, E. S. (2007). The challenge of white collar sentencing. *The Journal of criminal law and criminology, 12(6), 731-759.*

[16] Rail, G., & Harvey, J. (1995). Body at work: Michel Foucault and the sociology of sport. *Sociology of sport journal, 12*(2), 164-179.

[17] Reichel, P., & Albanese, J. (Eds.). (2013). *Handbook of transnational crime and justice*:Sage publications.

[18] Reichel, P., & Albanese, J. (Eds.). (2013). *Handbook of transnational crime and justice*:Sage publications.

[19] Wheaton, E. M., Schauer, E. J., & Galli, T. V. (2010). Economics of human trafficking. *International Migration, 48*(4), 114-141.