CRISIS OF BALOCHISTAN EFFECT MENTAL HEALTH STATUS AND STIR LIFESATISFACTION OF SECTARIAN VICITMS

DR. MAHREEN SIDDIQUI
Department of Psychology, University of Balochistan Quetta

DR. SAKINA RIAZ
Assistant Professor, Department of Social Work, University of Karachi

IMRANA IMDAD
Department of Psychology, MS Scholar SZABIST Karachi

SHAKIR ALI
Lecturer, Department of Psychology, BUITEMS, Quetta

TAHIRA NAUDHANI
Assistant Professor, Department of Social Work, University of Balochistan

ABSTRACT
Present study aim is to investigate the mental health status and life satisfaction among victims of sectarian violence and their families of Balochistan cases. The study was conducted from Quetta city. Balochistan’s tribal and multicultural setup enriched and different people are living together. From last two decades peace and harmony of the province is disturb due to law and order situation and most of the people are suffering in distress or mental health issues which directly affect their life satisfaction. Present study is an endeavor to investigate the mental health issues which were started due to sectarian violence. No significant research has ever been compiled to measure the degree of damages in Balochistan. Sample of the present study is comprised 200 male and female (Male= 100 Females = 100) of ages 20 to 40 years (M= 28.2, SD =2.04). Participants of the study were selected from victims and their families. The measures were used: Personal information form, Satisfaction with Life Scale (SWLS; Diener, Emmons, Larsen, &Griffin, 1985) Depression, anxiety and stress Scale- 21 (Lovibond & Lovibond, 1995). Research data was statistically examined through Descriptive statistic and Pearson Product Moment Correlation was used to find out the effect of depression, anxiety and stress (DASS) and its relationship with life satisfaction. Results of the study were revealed that depression, stress and anxiety (r = .078) effect life satisfaction. Findings showed that sectarian violence of Balochistan is a massive cause of distress which is threat for harmony or solidarity.

Key words: Depression, Stress, Anxiety, Life satisfaction, Violence, Harmony

INTRODUCTION
Pakistan is a place for minorities—confessional, religious and conceptual. Violence, conventional, operational and demanded with strange consistency has minority societies and forced them to escape. Pakistan is a country which suffering a severe revival in sectarian violence. Repeatedly, such violence contains clashes between followers of the two central groups of Islam – Sunnis and Shias. The discriminate occurrence and violence of Sunni-Shia clangs approach state safety Pakistan’s is the second-largest Shia inhabitants in the world after Iran - as well as two-sided families with Iran and the regional control forceful vis-à-vis Saudi Arabian effect. The present revival of Sectarian violence has extent throughout the country and is progressively focused at excluded objectives such as Balochistan’s Hazaras and believers of Sufi shrines. Balochistan is the largest but least populated province of Pakistan, Balochistan province is observing two diverse conflicts (DR. MIR SADAAT BALOCH, DR. SIRAJ BASHIR, MS. HANANAH ZARRAR, AFTAB ASLAM, DR. MUNEERA, 2023). Baloch ethno-nationalist insurgency and targeted violence against the Hazara Shia community. Both conflicts are very different and exclusive in their nature and dynamics. The Baloch ethno-nationalist uprising is almost as ancient as the alliance of Pakistan and it is marked at either realizing political and financial independence at the provincial level or achievement whole freedom from the federation of Pakistan.
In light of the rising present Balochistan is in the control of two distinctive and commonly exclusive ethno state and religious movements that include significant tracks of its harsh and mountainous territory. As in past, where pronounced Kingdoms and royal controls imposed on the native dynamics of Balochistan, the War on Terror has brought countless state and non-state performers into Balochistan and in the process provoked the socio-political dynamics of unstable region in contemporary times. Critical analysis of the twin dynamics of religious activism and ethnic conflict in Balochistan and it reproduce complications for domestic, regional and global security. (Siddiqui, 2012).

Hazaras are an ethnic group mostly lived in Afghanistan, but also with a large population in Pakistan, with approximately extending between 650,000 and 900,000. The mainly Hazaras population in Pakistan live in the city of Quetta, the provincial capital of Balochistan. While some Hazaras are Sunni, the majority identify as Shia. Sectarian violence is a decades-old risk in Pakistan, though, in Balochistan it is a comparatively current occurrence. The first attack and violence beside the Hazaras took place in 2003 (Ahmad Wani, 2019).

The Pakistani Hazara Shias are relegated non-combative migrants who face directed violence in Pakistan, and face from countless tasks which compromise their life satisfaction and mental health. Jafree et.al., (2023).

A report published by Pakistan’s National Commission for Human Rights (NCHR), approximately more than 2,000 Hazara Shias have been killed in Balochistan during last 14 years (NCHR 2018). Furthermore, 40,000 Hazara Shias have left Pakistan and traveled to other countries to protect their lives (NCHR 2018). Some Hazara Shias are native people of Balochistan while other are migrated. They have moved from Afghanistan. According to NCHR (2018) the population of the Hazara Shia community in Pakistan is among 0.4 and 0.5 million people. The history of Hazara community migration into Pakistan's Balochistan province in three different periods, the first from 1890 to 1893, the second from 1970 to 1985, and the third from 1996 to 2003-2004, during the Taliban rule and afterward (Devasher 2018).

While the Hazara emigrants are present in several cities of Pakistan, ‘the main and most noticeable provisional of Hazara migrants settled in the city of Quetta, which is presently located in Pakistan’s Balochistan Province’ (Ibrahim 2012,) Quetta the capital of Balochistan has also seen expanding sectarian clash, and the Shia-Sunni split in the city remains to accept importance in the War on Terror. Balochistan finds itself in the center of a difficult security connection that involves not only Great Powers (United States and China) but also local influences (Iran and India).

Donald, Green and Rachel (2003) discussed that to understand and treat the causes of ethnic violence, many social scientists have studied the beginnings of approaches about group prejudice. It reveals that indigenous level clashes over socio-economic assets and access to political power have currently become more significant, to the amount that they are changing the association between Sunni sectarian outfits and regional communities in Balochistan. Balochistan is Pakistan’s biggest province and most disturbed and violent province of the country in terms of its peace and security situation due to international financial interests. (Dr. Siraj Bashir, Dr. Waseem Sadiq, Dr. Huma Zafar, Anjuman Murtaza and Parveen Naseer, 2022). In Pakistan, Balochistan division 'hit NATO supply convoys crossing through Baluchistan to Afghanistan and attacks against Hazaras in Baluchistan as revenge against Hazara-Shias (Ali, 2021).

As discussed above that Pakistan has the biggest portion of the Muslims after Indonesia and the world’s biggest offer of Shias after Iran, it is measured that Sunnis include 80 to 85 percent of Pakistan’s populace, with Shias making up around 10 to 15 percent of the absolute remainder. As the Sunni-Shia partition has become politicized all through a significant part of the world, the equivalent has occurred in Pakistan — frequently with deadly outcomes borne disproportionately by the Shia minority. Assessments of the number killed or injured in sectarian attacks vary depending on the basis, all statistics specify that sectarian violence in Pakistan remains discomfort where most of the time people suffer in depression, stress, anxiety, de-motivated and generally withdraw from others. Depression is a severe mood disorder covered a variety of negative moods and behavioral changes and is the fourth leading cause of social incapacitation in the world. Stress is usually characterized by a sense of feeling overwhelmed. This feeling may be due to weak coping capacity being over-stretched or having been
under pressure for too long. Some stress can help to perform day to day functions, too much stress generate “distressed” and often exhausted. (Dr. Kinza Farooq, Prof. Dr. Nasreen Aslam, Dr. Siraj Bashir, Dr. Muhammad Nadeemullah and Dr. Aliya Ali, 2022)

In present day stress, apprehension and depression are consistently found among victims. According to the Pakistan Institute for Peace Studies (PIPS-2012) report total 658 individuals were killed in sectarian attacks in 2013 alone. And in the first six months of 2014, the South Asia Terrorism Portal (SATP) identified 51 different sectarian attacks in the country, in which 140 Individuals were murdered and 198 causalities. Due to this among people of Balochistan anxiety and sense of fear or dread that something terrible is going to happen provoke. Anxiety can be general or specific to a place, social situation or thing (phobia). Depressed sectarian victims in Baluchistan experience emotional disturbance which is in the form of sadness, hopelessness and lack of interest in the world around him. Death of a loved one, loss of properties and belongings, loss of shelter, caused by violence will lead to all sort of stress if treatment action is not done (Sankar, Wani. Amin, 2016).

Shia community’s life satisfaction is deprived, which is an amount of an individual’s prosperity, surveyed concerning state of mind, relationship fulfillment, accomplished objectives, self-ideas, and self-actualization capacity to adapt to life. Wellbeing or life satisfaction includes an ideal disposition towards one’s life – instead of an evaluation of current sentiments. Living in an environment where human rights are perceived to be respected can enhance happiness and life satisfaction (Ericson, and Vinson, 2012). Unfortunately, in Balochistan observed that they are not satisfied, therefore most of them were left to abroad and others are trying to leave this country. Purpose of the study is to find out the factors of life satisfaction and mental health disorders in Hazara Shias and determine psychological distress.

**LITERATURE REVIEW**

The current literature has significant strengths such as effectively examining the sectarian violence in various countries. Previous researches indicate that religious clash seems in different nations. Farrell and associates (2014) studied that since 1780 rift between Catholic and Protestant masses have happened with a disappointing occurrence in both ruler and urban settings in the north of Ireland. The Dolly’s Brae competition of 1849 was only one illustrate in a long list of sectarian killings faithful by both Orange and Green in the extended nineteenth century. This would not be mainly unexpected to anybody who were aware with the exist violence that waves Northern Ireland. Indeed, by viewing Ulster’s past through the spectacles of the present conflict, most experts merely have expected that Catholics and Protestants have been rebellious frequently since Protestant immigrants reached in Ireland in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. Though this sign evidently holds a great agreement of reality, it has directed to the formation of an unsuccessful break in Irish history.

Cairns and Darby, (1998) conducted a specific research which is supportive to place the conflict in Northern Ireland in perception. In its core, the conflict is a legal concern between two diverse groups: Catholics, or separatists, who want to connect the rest of the island of Ireland, and Protestants, or unionists, who demand to endure share of the United Kingdom. During the most current series of sectarian violence, recognized as the Distress, nearly 3,600 individuals were executed. Sectarian motivated demise amounts emaciated in the initial and mid-1970s and have diminished subsequent the 1998 Belfast Agreement. However, sectarian conflicts did not completely diminish with the validation of the harmony solidarity. On the opposing, pressures between Catholics and Protestants persist a endless part of lifespan in Northern Ireland (Shirlow & Murtagh, 2006).

Al-Marashi, (2007) studied about Iraqi media have been shown in spite of the occurrence of hundreds of reporters and numerous digital television channels in the state, in deliberated dissimilarity to the five public maintained dailies and single satellite channel that occurred during the Ba’ath era. This strategy newspaper reports the essential for active investigation of the Iraqi media and its representation of ethno-sectarian changes in Iraqi civilization.

Pinkston described Sunni, Shia, and Christian nationalstill those who are living together, devoted to defending their neighbors and avoiding theroaming paramilitaries and demise groups from arriving. Consequently no one has been captured or enforced to change out of a national. Altogether studies of Baghdad to period have studied how and why violence accelerated afterwards the unlimited disturbance produced by the US attack, by clarifying important dislikes between Sunni and Shiite groups of Islam, Sunni-Shia political relatives in Iraq and locally, and the central part played by performer leaders in ‘constructing’ sectarian dislike, terror, and weakness in Baghdad’s quickly unstable and confused setting. This investigation acquired a diverse method, looking for to comprehend why certain parts rejected to mass, provision, or link the dual record dynamic sectarian paramilitaries. (Dr. Akbar Ali Awan1, Dr. Naveed Hussain Shah, Dr. Siraj Bashir, Muhammad Abu Bakar Iqbal, Nadia Parveen Thalho, Joseph Fredrick Mutupha, 2021)

Chandran, (2003) has described that two events in Quetta exhausted to generate the Shia-Sunni sectarian violence in Pakistan. The first incident take place in June in (2003), when twelve police men belonging to the Shia community were murder in Quetta. The second removed in early July 2003 when forty five persons belonging to the Shia community were murdered in an imambargah, thought they were presenting prayers. That was the period when sectarian dispute started in Baluchistan. (Siraj Bashir, Muhammad Arshad, Sadia Barrech, 2019). Yet, associations among the two communities have been stressed since 1989, as an outcome of a spreading Shia-Sunni accountability mark. More than 5000 individuals have been murdered in the last fourteen years owed to sectarian violence. However sectarian division has always occurred in Pakistan. Definite progresses, inside and outside the country in the 1980s, improved the amount of violent clashes and victims. Bases for sectarian violence are numerous aspects contributed to the development of sectarian violence in the 1980s and 90s. Specific endless grounds were their while others ultimately extended the sectarian issues. Before evaluating these grounds, it is vital to emphasis on the evidences linked to sectarian violence in Pakistan and takes them in the correct side. (Sadia Barrech, Dr Siraj Bashir, Dr Mir Saadat Baloch, & Fauzia Safdar, 2019)

Irfani, (2004) discussed about three consistent components of history, values and politics sustaining the sectarian violence nowadays, anywhere a historical background of the Shia-Sunni dispute advocates that religious/sectarian violence in Pakistan has supposed different ways at dissimilar historical crises. Furthermore, not only are the manners of religious violence (both sectarian and jihadi, anywhere sectarian = Shia-Sunni confrontation; jihadi = liberatorfight, holy conflict) consistent, they also are similarly a consequence of a disaster in cultural distinctiveness as well as of actual financial and political dynamics. Besides finally the connections between national political demands and the essential of global politics specify that Pakistan’s insidepart cannot be assumed independently of U. S. and Indian policies vis-à-vis Afghanistan and Kashmir. The Shia-Sunni distribute, however they endured a foundation of simmering strain throughout the Mughal regulation, and by the chance of the nineteenth century taken “developed into full-scale polemical conflict, each side critical the other of being heretics and infidels. Such a development, however, that was a part of an extreme discussion about Muslim social and religious organizations at ainstant obvious by the rise of British control and loss of Mughal power, as certainly the contestation of rising Shia demand by a newly evolving Sunni activist effort that got recognized. Phillips (2015) since the occurrence of political war in Syria in 2011 the clash has often been defined as ‘sectarian’, a story that distributes the various Syrian people into politicized ethno-sectarian groups. According to this outlook, the 12% of the inhabitants that are Alawi, a reserved division of Shia Islam, provision the system of President Bashar al-Assad, he has an Alawi who, was similar his father and ancestor, restricted his personal sect. The 64% who are Sunni Arab, Syria’s biggest ethno-sectarian population, commonly support the resistance, taking relegated under the Assads. Syria’s other non-Sunni Arab spiritual groups, the Christians (9%), Druze (3%), Shia (1%) and various others (1%) back the regime, dread perception under Sunni Arab common rule. Ten percent (10%) Syrians those who are Kurdish and Sunnirecognize with their specific ethnic group and select objectivity. This description is frequently stayed by an ancient interior identity. Syria is showed as an imitate government made by Britain and France at the end of the First World War, and a ‘disruption dejected of Sykes-Picot’ created on ethno-sectarian
personalities. These ‘ancient aversions’ among Sunnis and Shia were recharged by the 2003. The disadvantages of this account should not unseen, though sectarian grounded killing, sexual violence, kidnappings, ethnic cleansing and disloyal verbal obligate all occurred. The sudden outbreak of ethno-sectarian violence in before passive multi-ethnic conditions has extensive been the subject of hypothetical consideration.

Hiltermann, (2007) described those challenges offailing government structure that stayed made on pathetic state identities and has been riskily deteriorated by the illegitimacy of extended repressive law. Iraq is seen as having encouraged Shia inhabitants through the district in a Shia revival that feeds oneras of judgment and destruction of nation and sacred services. This has produced a Sunni criticism and is pressured dreads of insecurity in Arab domains (for example Shia majorities sovereign Iraq and looking for authority in Bahrain) and real independence in the case of the Shia inhabitants of Saudi Arabia’s oil-rich. Although certainly there has been an improvement in arrogance approximately such arift, and while there have been actions of terrible sectarian violence in Iraq, new progresses do not recommend an unbridgeable gulf. The growth of Shia sect in Islam as a major distinct in Iraq and in other countries, where Shia establish a main share of the population might be existent, but it is moderated frequently and extremely by challenging causes of identity and devotion. Population, culture, society, circle and family all endure characters signs at slightest as prevailing as spiritual association. In circumstances considered by confusion and vagueness, wherever the government has vanished a situation once prevailing in all features of humanity, people’s uniqueness has develop just as inconsistent as the foundations of influence and violence themselves, and religion is only one of numerous objects of rival for people’s adherence. Instead, the additional important clash in the Middle East is between Shia and Sunni sects.

Jasser (2014) identified that Syria’s civil war was observed by the international community, comprise the United Nations, the International Committee of the Red Cross and several non-governmental groups, mainly decide that the Assad system has devoted extensive human rights exploitation over the encounter. This comprises disrespectful its duties below the 1949 Geneva Conventions and Further Procedure in 1977 revision that extrarequirements that the government has obviously disturb, containing unselective occurrences on citizen inhabitants, and damage of nutrition, water, and other resources required for existence. In addition, extrajudicial murders, rape, and distress have been well recognized. Most recently, U.S. President Obama established that the Syrian establishment has released chemical weapons. There are also groups allied with the resistance who have devoted offenses against civilization including extrajudicial punishments as well as pursuing Christian ministry. With human distress and hazards to area constancy increasing, there is a rising determination to end the conflict and conspiracy a sequence to confirm constancy for all Syrians. As the son of Syrian-American settlers and a member of the U.S. Commission on International Religious Freedom (USCIRF), the violence in Syria is particular while this war adversity every time.


Methodology:

Participants
In this study, a sample of 200 sectarian victims was recruited from different areas of Quetta city. Sample of the existing study was divided into two groups (male = 100 and females = 100). The age of the respondents ranged between 20 years and 40 years ($M = 28.2, SD = 2.04$), etc.

Description of Measures
Personal information was acquired by items directing the respondent’s age, gender, residence, family structure (indigenous and migrated) and family income, etc.

Depression Anxiety and Stress Scale (DAAS-21; Lovibond & Lovibond, 1995).
The DASS is a 21-item questionnaire which includes three self-report scales designed to measure the negative emotional states of depression, anxiety and stress. The DASS is a dimensional measure of symptoms of stress, anxiety and depression and was developed on non-clinical samples. The DASS Depression scale is highly correlated with the Beck Depression Inventory (r = .74) (BDI; Beck et al., 1996) while the DASS Anxiety scale and the BAI were correlated r = 0.81 (Beck & Steer, 1990).

Satisfaction With Life Scale (SWLS; Diener, Emmons, Larsen, & Griffin, 1985)
Life satisfaction scale is designed to measure global cognitive judgments of one’s life; it is a judgmental component of subjective wellbeing (SWB). This measure assesses satisfaction of respondents’ life as a whole (not a measure of either positive or negative affect).

Procedure
Test was individually administrated to sectarian victims of Baluchistan province. Researcher approached to the victims get consent for data gathering. After getting consent from them, examiner briefed about the rationale of the study and sure them data will entirely use for research and their answers will not be exposed to others. Then Personal Information form, Depression Anxiety and Stress and Satisfaction with Life scales were administered to assess the mental health status and life satisfaction of the participants.

Scoring and statistical analysis
After completing the data collection, DASS and SWLS were scored according to standardized scoring procedures. The data analysis was carried out through Statistical Package for Social Sciences Version 22 (SPSS; V.22). Descriptive statistics was carried out to describe the frequencies and percentages. Further on Pearson Product Moment Correlation for investigating strength of relationship among variables.

RESULTS
Table 1
Percentages of financial status and living standards of participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Financial status</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Living status</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>Indigenous</td>
<td>74.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>26</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>50</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Migrated</td>
<td>25.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Correlation between depression and satisfaction with life (SWL)
Results indicate that value of -0.078 with p-value 0.441.

Table 3 Correlation between anxiety and satisfaction with life (SWL)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>SWL</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Correlation</td>
<td>1.000</td>
<td>-.078</td>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.441</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4 Correlation between Stress and satisfaction with life (SWL)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>SWL</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Correlation</td>
<td>1.000</td>
<td>-.196</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.</td>
<td>.051</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Result indicates the value is -0.196 while P-value is 0.051.

DISCUSSION

The purpose of present study was an examination to the relationship of mental health and life satisfaction among sectarian victims in Balochistan. Demographic information showed that 50% Participants were financially sound because they are doing jobs and permanent employee’s government of Balochistan while others are self-employed. However they are always try to provide better services and perform their responsibilities. While due to undefined violence most of them are facing anxiety, depression and stress. Total 74.4% are indigenous population and 25.6% were migrated from Afghanistan. Participant’s mean age is 28.2, SD 2.04.

Results further indicate that value of depression is -0.078 with p-value = 0.441. Scores did not reveal that significant relationship with life satisfaction and depression among participants. It is found that relationships between satisfaction with life and depression are negative. Finding revealed that depression seems to be effective and comprehensive which cannot easily manage or cope because they are gradually facing same environment. Due to this depression and life satisfaction are negative.

Previous researches have also found non-significant relationships between satisfaction with life and
depression. Rosenbaum (1989) Depression relates to clinical observations in the community and acute care settings of persons of diverse cultural backgrounds. During undefined situation maintenance of life satisfaction is an immense challenge to stop depression, anxiety or stress, because satisfaction of life is very essential for victim’s mental health.

Relationship between anxiety and life satisfaction is $r = -0.196$ which shows that inverse effect, result revealed that life satisfaction has no association to anxiety during in current scenario. Result indicates that $r = -0.293$ which illustrate that among stress and life satisfaction there is weak inverse effect but $P$-value is significant. Finding revealed that obligation, supremacy, elegance, proficient clash and emotional cost from concerned have been the main causes of victim’s sufferings but there is correspondence as to extent of their impact. Harbom and Wallenstein (2007) discussed that one third of all states have practiced internal clash since 1991. Mostly they were satisfied because they are doing jobs and performing their frame of referencing in life but after attacks they experience high levels of stress/distress. Baluchistan’s deprived aspects are creating emotional instabilities among population which is massive problem of the residences. Due to this different domains are facing massive difficulties consequently anxiety, depression and stress which is very harmful for peace and harmony of the country and region.

CONCLUSION

On the basis of our findings, it may be concluded that present study also helps to researchers to have some analysis related to sectarian studies or violence. In Pakistan it is not done like other countries about 34% people are living with depression, stress and anxiety disorders. Psychological problem among sectarian victims is neglected as we have just one psychiatrist for above then two million citizens. We have only about 750 psychiatrists, 478 psychologists and 3145 social workers for the whole of the country (Prabhakar et al., 2013). It is recommended to conduct further researches on same issue. Lack of an inclusive state restriction, sectarian violence intimidates to deteriorate Pakistan’s insubstantial security position.

In current scenario Pakistan have different challenges therefore stakeholders should develop better facilities for health professionals.

REFERENCES

[10] Dr. Kinza Farooq, Prof. Dr. Nasreen Aslam, Dr. Siraj Bashir, Dr. Muhammad Nadeemullah and Dr. Aliya Ali., 2022. Students Experiment of Online Classes during the Pandemic of COVID-19 and their Socio-economic affection toward Psychological impact on their Learning Behaviors’. (With Special Reference to University of Karachi).


[24] Prof Dr. Akbar Ali Awans1, Dr. Naveed Hussain Shah , Dr. Siraj Bashir , Muhammad AbuBakar Iqbal , Nadia Parveen Thalho , Joseph Fredrick Mutupha.(2021). CRITICAL THINKING AND CREATIVE THINKING: STUDENTS’ READING COMPREHENSION, Webology ,Volume 18, Number 6


